From: Stewart McGarrity [Stewart.McGarrity@tie.ltd.uk]

**Sent:** 03 February 2010 16:07

To: Alan Coyle Cc: Gregor Roberts

Subject: RE: Pitchfork (Private & Confidential) - WS7 Financial Analysis - 2009 Work

Attachments: 23004433\_1\_UKMATTERS(BSC Issues 12 02 09) - DLA Evalueation matrix Options A-

F.doc; InfracoOptionsAnalysis040309 - Programme and Outturn Costs.doc;

InfracoOptionsAnalysis080309 - Commercial.doc; InfracoOptionsAnalysis080309 -

Scope.doc; InfracoOptionsAnalysis 070909 - A future without BB.doc;

tieOptionsAnalysis\_11\_March\_2009 Board Paper.doc; Tram Truncation (CEC Internal

Paper).doc

## Alan,

I've been getting a row for not using the extranet to provide documents to people but its disnae work if they don't have access. You have all the docs already but they are all attached to this email in any case. I've also asked out ICT team to give you access to the Pitchfork folders.

Stewart

Stewart McGarrity
Finance Director
tie Limited
Mobile:0

From: Alan Coyle [mailto:Alan.Coyle@edinburgh.gov.uk]

**Sent:** 03 February 2010 15:08

To: Stewart McGarrity

Subject: RE: Pitchfork (Private & Confidential) - WS7 Financial Analysis - 2009 Work

I'm having problems getting this link to work.

Regards

Alan Coyle | Financial Services | Corporate Finance Team (Edinburgh Trams) | Level 2/6 Waverley Court | 4 East Market St EH8 8BG | alan.coyle@edinburgh.gov.uk |

Phone 01 Mobile 0

**From:** Stewart McGarrity [mailto:Stewart.McGarrity@tie.ltd.uk]

**Sent:** 02 February 2010 18:32

To: Richard Jeffrey; Steven Bell; Alastair Richards; Dennis Murray; Tony Rush (rush\_aj@ \_\_\_\_\_; Susan Clark;

Frank McFadden

**Cc:** Gregor Roberts; Alan Coyle

Subject: Pitchfork (Private & Confidential) - WS7 Financial Analysis - 2009 Work

You should not forward this email to any party not on the original distribution list. The contents of this email are likely to be exempt from FOISA disclosure under Section 36(2)b of the Freedom of information (Scotland) Act 2002

Pitchfork (Private & Confidential) – WS7 Financial Analysis - Previous Work

All,

As a reference point to the Financial Analysis which supports in the main WS5, I thought it would be worthwhile brushing off all the analysis and conclusions we came to in 2009. The link below is to the suite of documents which I've put on the extranet...

Workstream7 - Financial Analysis - Commercial and Scope Options 2009

The quick guide to what they are:

11 March 09 Board Paper 080309 - Commercial 080309 - Scope DLA Evaluation Matrix

The Board paper and its two appendices from March 2009 – which looked at the Commercial Options A-F (including replacing BB or tie stepping into their shoes). At that time there was no consideration of dividing the project up such that BB carried on with some of it and we found another way to deliver civils on the onstreet section. The scope piece examines the operational feasibility and possible cost reductions due to truncation at various points. We would now consider "truncation" to mean "phased construction optioneering". We did not look at the operational implications of stopping at Haymarket including revenues, costs and bus integration – even if this was only a temporary operation for say a year. DLAs comparative legal analysis of each of each option

## 040309 - Programme & Outturn Costs

This paper was not in the event included in the Board paper in March 09 but sought to compare outturn costs and timescales of each of the commercial options – informed by some sterling work by Dennis and Gregor on the cost implications of each. What I will do is try to repeat this in an appropriate – probably more granular way for the options we are considering now.

## 070909 - A future without BB

Paper prepared for David Mackay to brief Ministers on the implications of going forward without BB in the consortium.

## **Savings from Truncation - Sep09**

A more detailed paper from Steven and Dennis on the estimated cost savings from truncation – in this case conceived as complete removal of sections of Phase 1a from the BSC contract.

Regards,

Stewart

Stewart McGarrity
Finance Director
tie Limited
Mobile:07

The information transmitted is intended only for the person to whom it is addressed and may contain confidential and/or privileged material. If you are not the intended recipient of this e-mail please notify the sender immediately at the email address above, and then delete it.

E-mails sent to and by our staff are monitored for operational and lawful business purposes including assessing compliance with our company rules and system performance. TIE reserves the right to monitor emails sent to or from addresses under its control.

No liability is accepted for any harm that may be caused to your systems or data by this e-mail. It is the recipient's responsibility to scan this e-mail and any attachments for computer viruses.

Senders and recipients of e-mail should be aware that under Scottish Freedom of Information legislation and the Data Protection legislation these contents may have to be disclosed to third parties in response to a request.

| tie Limited registered in Scotland No. SC230949. Registered office - City Chambers, High Street, Edinburgh, EH1 1YT.   |
|--|
| ***************************************  |
| This email and files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended for the sole use of the individual or organisation to whom they are addressed.  |
| If you have received this eMail in error please notify the sender immediately and delete it without using, copying, storing, forwarding or disclosing its contents to any other person.  |
| The Council has endeavoured to scan this eMail message and attachments for computer viruses and will not be liable for any losses incurred by the recipient.   |
| ***************************************  |
|  |
| The information transmitted is intended only for the person to whom it is addressed and may contain confidential and/or privileged material. If you are not the intended recipient of this e-mail please notify the sender immediately at the email address above, and then delete it. |
| E-mails sent to and by our staff are monitored for operational and lawful business purposes including assessing compliance with our company rules and system performance. TIE reserves the right to monitor emails sent to or from addresses under its control.                        |
| No liability is accepted for any harm that may be caused to your systems or data by this e-mail. It is the recipient's responsibility to scan this e-mail and any attachments for computer viruses.  |
| Senders and recipients of e-mail should be aware that under Scottish Freedom of Information legislation and the Data Protection legislation these contents may have to be disclosed to third parties in response to a request.   |
| tie Limited registered in Scotland No. SC230949. Registered office - City Chambers, High Street, Edinburgh, EH1 1YT.   |
|  |
|  |