

Colin Smith

---

**From:** Anthony Rush [anthony@[REDACTED]]  
**Sent:** 02 March 2011 09:05  
**To:** 'Anthony Rush'; richard.jeffrey@tie.ltd.uk; vicemery@[REDACTED]; csmith@hg-group.co.uk; robson.nigel@[REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Deckchair vs GHP view 280211.xlsx - strictly private and confidential, foisa exempt, prepared in anticipation of litigation

---

**From:** Anthony Rush [mailto:rush\_aj@[REDACTED]]  
**Sent:** 02 March 2011 09:04  
**To:** 'richard.jeffrey@tie.ltd.uk'; 'vicemery@[REDACTED]'; 'csmith@hg-group.co.uk'; 'robson.nigel@[REDACTED]'  
**Subject:** FW: Deckchair vs GHP view 280211.xlsx - strictly private and confidential, foisa exempt, prepared in anticipation of litigation

---

**From:** Anthony Rush [mailto:rush\_aj@[REDACTED]]  
**Sent:** 02 March 2011 09:01  
**To:** 'Richard Jeffrey'; 'VRE - MobileMe'; 'Colin Smith'; 'Nigel Robson'  
**Subject:** RE: Deckchair vs GHP view 280211.xlsx - strictly private and confidential, foisa exempt, prepared in anticipation of litigation

Thanks Richard

My job is to challenge and I do challenge the deck-chair numbers. Moreover, the telecon the other day which was intended to explain the numbers to Colin, Nigel and me didn't help.

I haven't seen any output from Cyril Sweett but the civils work may be the least of our worries. We have no clear handle on the market costs of the Systems.

I will be happy to look again at Gregor's numbers because the potential cost of Separation is a critical threshold on which we may decide to ditch Phoenix or conversely decide to agree on a price for Phoenix which is higher than we needed to. But ditching Phoenix is an irrevocable action with an uncertain end.

Tony

---

**From:** Richard Jeffrey [mailto:Richard.Jeffrey@tie.ltd.uk]  
**Sent:** 02 March 2011 08:23  
**To:** VRE - MobileMe; Colin Smith; Anthony Rush; Nigel Robson  
**Subject:** FW: Deckchair vs GHP view 280211.xlsx - strictly private and confidential, foisa exempt, prepared in anticipation of litigation

I have seen a copy of a report prepared by GHP (I'm not sure who commissioned it) which gives figures for separation and phoenix which give a markedly different perspective to tie's figures. Without comment on which set of figures I think more reliable we have produced a reconciliation of GHP's numbers back to ours, which is attached for info.

Regards

Richard

---

**From:** Gregor Roberts  
**Sent:** 01 March 2011 17:51