

---

**From:** Dorrington, Kim (Edinburgh Tram)  
**Sent:** 12 April 2007 13:19  
**To:** Chandler, Jason; Reynolds, Steve  
**Cc:** Ney, Scott  
**Subject:** FW: A+DS COMMENTS  
**Attachments:** Scan001.PDF

**Importance:** High

Jason - I would like to discuss with you on your return - we need to decide on a standpoint regarding this issue  
Regards  
Kim

---

**From:** Trudi Craggs [mailto:Trudi.Craggs@tie.ltd.uk]  
**Sent:** 12 April 2007 06:56  
**To:** Dorrington, Kim (Edinburgh Tram)  
**Subject:** FW: A+DS COMMENTS  
**Importance:** High

Kim

Ahead of our meeting at 10am this morning, I am forwarding to you a copy of the response we received from Architecture and Design Scotland together with Aileen's initial comments. I would like to discuss this then.

Trudi

---

**From:** Aileen Grant [mailto:Aileen.Grant@dundas-wilson.com]  
**Sent:** Sun 08/04/2007 09:27  
**To:** Trudi Craggs; Ian Spence  
**Cc:** Gavin Murray  
**Subject:** A+DS COMMENTS

Hi Trudi and Ian

I am sending you another copy of the letter from Architecture and Design Scotland. Having had time to think about the response, I would now suggest the following.

Point 1.1 - I think it is for tie (and SDS?) to respond to the allegation that the project lacks design vision. They note that the project appears to be dictated by engineering requirements and that financial considerations seem to be hindering greater design opportunities. In this regard, I think SDS should justify their design approach. We could also explain what has happened through the Charette process for the key spaces. However, I still have concerns about the actual design outcome for the Charette spaces. As became clear during the Charettes, it is not really the tram design which is failing to maximise design opportunities, but the constraints imposed by traffic management objectives, and perhaps this should be articulated.

Point 1.2 - I think it is for tie and SDS to respond to the allegation that there is a lack of visual imagery. This point can also be explored at the next Tram Design Working Group when we discuss the question of visualisations.

Point 1.3 - I think the Council should respond to this point - the link to other strategic exercises. On the day I suggested that this should

be through the new City Local Plan but I have not yet seen this document and so I don't know if it is adequately addressed here.

Point 2.1 - This point is clearly addressed to the Council and may be addressed through the Tram Public Realm Strategy. I also think A+DS should be asked to respond to the point about lack of funding which Ian put to them on the day.

Point 2.2 - the need for a townscape analysis of the consequences of a reduced number of buses. This is an interesting idea, however, how much of this is within the power of the Council or TEL to control? This may need discussion by the Tram Project Board?

Point 3.1 - Improving the public realm is (in my understanding) a matter for the Council. However, we should collectively find an effective way of describing this to the outside world, and we still have to sort out the joint working arrangements.

Point 3.2 - Townscape implications are a matter for tie and SDS to address. Platform design has been discussed at TDWG and in the charettes. The design statements may provide a way of addressing this concern, but in townscape terms I share A+DS' concern about the fences around substations - and this is contrary to the terms of the Tram Design Manual (as I have pointed out). But the Council seem to be accepting these in their informal consultation sessions. Perhaps we should discuss this one further.

Point 3.3 - I am not clear with this point if A+DS are happy with present arrangements (and your role, Ian) or if they want a new "Tram Planning Design Manager" to be appointed. I think it is the former, but perhaps we need to take forward some of the points Ian, Duncan and I discussed on 22nd March. What do you think?

Point 3.4 - I am not sure what the appropriate response should be to this. Iconic structures - will there be any at all? Through the Structures Charettes we were trying to get some kind of iconic structure for Edinburgh Park, but I'm not sure if this is being progressed in this way. I am aware that you have been taking it forward, Ian. With regard to the suggestion of individual design of tram stops, this does rather cut across what we have just been discussing at the Tram Design Working Group, and also the guidance in the Tram Design Manual. I think we should review these comments and ensure we have a clear and robust position for the next TDWG. Ultimately it is for Council to advise on the design approach for tram stops and shelters.

I hope these thoughts are helpful. I think we need to send a copy of the comments to SDS - to Jason certainly and presumably also Kim - and set up a meeting to review the comments with them. The key question, Ian, is how much weight should be given to these views?

Perhaps we can get time this week/next week to discuss this.

Regards  
Aileen

Aileen Grant  
Senior Planner  
Tel: [REDACTED]  
Switchboard +44 (0) 131 228 8000  
Web: [www.dundas-wilson.com](http://www.dundas-wilson.com)

-----Original Message-----

From: [scanner@dundas-wilson.com](mailto:scanner@dundas-wilson.com) [<mailto:scanner@dundas-wilson.com>]  
Sent: 03 April 2007 08:59 AM

To: Aileen Grant  
Subject: Scan from a Xerox WorkCentre Pro

Please open the attached document. It was scanned and sent to you using a Xerox WorkCentre Pro.

Sent by: Guest [scanner@dundas-wilson.com] Number of Images: 3  
Attachment File Type: PDF

WorkCentre Pro Location: 14 XEROX MFD 14 - 3rd Floor South Resource area  
A Device Name: XRX0000AA6F15F5

For more information on Xerox products and solutions, please visit <http://www.xerox.com>

D&W Vision - D&W's employment law webinar series, where all your employment training needs come to you. To give you a flavour we are offering a Free trial, visit our website [www.dundas-wilson.com](http://www.dundas-wilson.com) to download now !

Dundas & Wilson LLP (Registered in England & Wales with registered number OC309328 and having its registered office at Northwest Wing, Bush House, Aldwych, London WC2B 4EZ) and Dundas & Wilson CS LLP (Registered in Scotland with registered number SO300441 and having its registered office at Saltire Court, 20 Castle Terrace, Edinburgh EH1 2EN) (either or both "D&W") are limited liability partnerships. Further information can be found at <http://www.dundas-wilson.com/links/privacy.php>. D&W members' names may be seen at their offices. Any reference to a "partner" of D&W in any communication is to a member of the relevant LLP. D&W accepts no liability for personal emails.

This email is confidential. It may contain privileged information. D&W try to ensure that emails are free from viruses and other harmful items. Emails are scanned for viruses by MessageLabs. You must not rely on this and must scan this email and any attachment for harmful items including viruses. D&W accept no liability if this email or any attachment harms any systems or data. If this email is not for you (or not meant for you to pass on) (1) please advise by reply and delete it, (2) you must not rely on it and (3) D&W prohibit saving copying, printing, forwarding or any other use of it whatsoever. D&W reserve the right to recall, delete and monitor all emails.

---

The information transmitted is intended only for the person to whom it is addressed and may contain confidential and/or privileged material. If you are not the intended recipient of this e-mail please notify the sender immediately at the email address above, and then delete it.

E-mails sent to and by our staff are monitored for operational and lawful business purposes including assessing compliance with our company rules and system performance. TIE reserves the right to monitor emails sent to or from addresses under its control.

No liability is accepted for any harm that may be caused to your systems or data by this e-mail. It is the recipient's responsibility to scan this e-mail and any attachments for computer viruses.

Senders and recipients of e-mail should be aware that under Scottish Freedom of Information legislation and the Data Protection legislation these contents may have to be disclosed to third parties in response to a request.

tie Limited registered in Scotland No. SC230949. Registered office - City Chambers, High Street, Edinburgh, EH1 1YT.

---