From: Ramsay J (John)

Sent: 13 September 2010 12:33

To: Reeve W (Bill); McLaughlin AC (Ainslie); Middleton DF (David); Fairweather S (Sharon)

Morrissey J (Jerry); Adamson L (Lucy)

Subject: Edinburgh Trams: Draft Report by Audit Scotland



Cc:

10-09-10_FINAL TS_ETN_Position...

As you know, following a series of recent press articles, and resultant political pressure, the Auditor General concluded that his position of not investigating an ongoing project engaged in both contractual and legal dispute was no longer sustainable. As a result, Audit Scotland agreed that a corporate approach utilising the knowledge of the local audit teams for Transport Scotland and City of Edinburgh Council and performance audit group should be used to assess the project situation. Accordingly I was invited last month to join a discussion with Mari-Anne Williamson and Bill Convery from Audit Scotland. In their invitation, Audit Scotland advised that their general aim was to gain an understanding of Transport Scotland's role in this project, from initial agreement by Ministers up to date.

The attached is a position statement which Audit Scotland has drawn up following their discussions with myself and CEC and which they intend to submit to their Performance Audit Group and Auditor General. This is described as a concise factual statement on the history of the project and the arrangements in place within Transport Scotland. However it also includes a degree of evaluation, which I am assured is Audit Scotland's assessment and opinion based on discussions both with myself and City of Edinburgh Council. Their initial draft has already been subject to a series of iterations, largely by me to correct factual inaccuracy but I also had to recommend a number of amendments to correct a measure of "opinion comment" which had crept in.

We are advised that once the Auditor General has received input from the City of Edinburgh Council audit team, the information will be considered in totality with a decision on any further work or formal reporting then being taken. At this time, I don't know what the timescale of this will be but the timing of the CEC report to full Council, due on 14 October should have some bearing.

John Ramsay Project manager - Edinburgh Trams Rail Directorate Transport Scotland Buchanan House Glasgow G4 0HF

