
From: Middleton DF (David)
Sent: 01 December 2010 10:05
To: McLaughlin AC (Ainslie)
Subject: Re: URGENT - TRAM Briefing

I probably should see Malcolm's note at some stage.

David

From: McLaughlin AC (Ainslie)
To: Middleton DF (David)
Sent: Wed Dec 01 10:01:42 2010
Subject: Re: URGENT - TRAM Briefing

My recollection at the time was that Ministers wanted to take what was described as a light touch. Malcolm put a note up recommending approach to take to meet that expectation. I can dig that note out and let you see.

I think it would be fair to say our assessment of the project at the time was much the same as AS. In this case the project appears to have gone wrong in the closing contract negotiations compounded by all accounts by political desire at Council level to push ahead when perhaps deferring the contract award several months would have been a wiser choice.

I suppose the question is: would we have been able to influence decisions had we still had a seat on the board. In my view the TIE board and CEC had a duty of care to satisfy themselves that the contract was sound before signing. I assume that decision must be minuted somewhere and on the basis that they are unlikely to have made the decision recklessly then I can't see our involvement would have made any difference. All a bit hypothetical though.

Ainslie

From: Middleton DF (David)
To: McLaughlin AC (Ainslie)
Sent: Wed Dec 01 09:04:28 2010
Subject: Re: URGENT - TRAM Briefing

Ainslie

Thanks. I didn't want to debate in front of AS last week - and I know you weren't directly involved - but why did we pull back in 2007. It must have been political to a degree.

David

From: McLaughlin AC (Ainslie)
To: Middleton DF (David)
Cc: Adamson L (Lucy); Johnstone RR (Raymund) (TRANS); Ramsay J (John)
Sent: Wed Dec 01 08:57:53 2010
Subject: Fw: URGENT - TRAM Briefing

David

You might find this useful to know. The last bullet point in particular will make it harder for AS to suggest TS should have seen this disaster coming.

We are putting together finishing touches to tram brief for Cab Sec for the 7th and a reference to this will do no harm as he's concerned he is vulnerable that SG/TS pulled back in 2007. I think he could justifiably argue that the AS findings gave him confidence TIE knew what they were doing and the project was in a good place at that time.

Ainslie

From: Ramsay J (John)
To: McLaughlin AC (Ainslie)
Sent: Tue Nov 30 19:46:51 2010
Subject: RE: URGENT - TRAM Briefing
Ainslie

you may find the attached extract taken from the 2007 Report press release - a copy of the full 2007 Report is also attached.
can discuss further requirements - hopefully I should make it to Glasgow tomorrow
hope this is helpful

Press release

For immediate release at 9.15am, Wednesday 20 June 2007.

Auditor General publishes review of transport projects (EARL & Trams)

The Auditor General for Scotland, Robert Black, has published his review of the arrangements for managing the delivery of the Edinburgh trams and Edinburgh Airport Rail Link (EARL) projects.

Mr Black said: "The objectives of the review were to assess whether the projects are progressing in accordance with time and cost targets, and whether appropriate management systems are in place to promote their successful completion. Our report provides a snapshot of where the two projects are at present. "It is important to emphasise that Audit Scotland has not reviewed the operating costs or projected revenues of the projects. Both of these factors could have a significant impact on the financial operation of each of the projects."

The key messages from the report are: Both projects have been through the parliamentary approval process to obtain statutory authority to proceed and have been developed in response to national, regional and local transport strategies.

Trams

- The current anticipated final cost of Phase 1 in its entirety is £593.8 million and estimated project costs have been subjected to robust testing.
- The Scottish Executive has committed to provide up to £500 million for Phase 1a of the project and City of Edinburgh Council a further £45 million. Funding for Phase 1b has yet to be confirmed.
- A total of £79 million was spent on the project up to the end of May 2007, which includes £17 million to take the project through the parliamentary process.
- Some slippage in the project has occurred but transport initiatives Edinburgh (**tie**) is taking action aimed at ensuring that Phase 1a can be operational by early 2011.
- Arrangements in place to manage the project include a clear corporate governance structure, well defined project management and organisation, sound financial management and reporting, good risk management procedures, and a procurement strategy aimed at minimising risk and delivering successful project outcomes.

John Ramsay

Project manager - Edinburgh Trams

Rail Directorate

Transport Scotland

Buchanan House

Glasgow G4 0HF

Tel [REDACTED]

mobile [REDACTED]

From: McLaughlin AC (Ainslie)
Sent: 30 November 2010 18:46
To: Ramsay J (John)
Subject: Re: URGENT - TRAM Briefing

John thanks can you recall what AS said about TIE, the project or the governance in their 2007 report

Ainslie

From: Ramsay J (John)
To: Purewal P (Parminder); Hannaway K (Kenneth); Johnstone RR (Raymund) (TRANS)
Cc: McLaughlin AC (Ainslie); Docherty C (Campbell); Adamson L (Lucy)
Sent: Tue Nov 30 18:31:49 2010
Subject: RE: URGENT - TRAM Briefing

Parminder

I have no comments

John Ramsay
Project manager - Edinburgh Trams
Rail Directorate
Transport Scotland
Buchanan House
Glasgow G4 0HF

Tel [REDACTED]

mobile [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]