

---

**From:** McLaughlin AC (Ainslie)  
**Sent:** 24 November 2011 10:37  
**To:** Gethins S (Stephen)  
**Subject:** Fw: trams

To see further line - we came off board in 2007

---

**From:** Ramsay J (John)  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 24, 2011 10:27 AM  
**To:** McLaughlin AC (Ainslie)  
**Subject:** RE: trams

Ainslie

As discussed;

**Agreed Line from previous FMQ:**

Transport Scotland was represented on the Tram Project Board until June 2007 when, following Auditor General's first report and Parliament's vote to support the project, it was decided to discontinue this level of involvement. Funding had been agreed following the vote in Parliament, the business case well advanced, the governance structure in place, the procurement strategy had been agreed and was underway and advance contracts had been let. City of Edinburgh Council remained the owner, and Transport Scotland as funder did not have the same oversight role for the trams project as it has for Scottish Government national transport projects. Audit Scotland's 2007 report "Edinburgh Transport Projects Review" stated that:

"Arrangements in place to manage the project appear sound with:

- a clear corporate governance structure for the project
- clearly defined project management
- sound financial management and reporting
- procedures in place to actively manage risks
- a clear procurement strategy aimed at minimising risk and delivering successful project outcomes."

**Extract from PAC Official Report 2 March 2011**

In 2007, with the Scottish Government having confirmed its funding position, capped at £500m, Transport Scotland was clearly in the role of funder on behalf of Scottish Ministers. The City of Edinburgh Council was the owner and Tie.Ltd was the project director.

The Scottish Government considered it was good governance for Transport Scotland to withdraw from the Tram Project Board and for these roles to be separated out to avoid a situation in which Transport Scotland was part of a project board that might make representation to itself as funder..

---

**From:** McLaughlin AC (Ainslie)  
**Sent:** 24 November 2011 10:19  
**To:** Ramsay J (John)  
**Subject:** Fw: trams

---

**From:** Gethins S (Stephen)  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 24, 2011 10:12 AM  
**To:** McLaughlin AC (Ainslie)  
**Subject:** trams

### **Edinburgh Trams Freedom of Information Request**

Information was released to Rami Okasha on the role of Transport Scotland in the trams. Information included submissions to John Swinney with advice on the Governance of the trams project amongst other things (eg EARL project).

- Information was redacted that was **not relevant** to the information request;
- Names of officials who have now left were redacted because of **privacy rules**;
- Information with **on going policy development** (eg concessionary fares) was redacted.

Other information was released:

- Advice given to Ministers on the decision to remove Transport Scotland in 2007.

Transport Scotland was removed in August 2007 because – “the City of Edinburgh Council was to be the owner of the owner and that it was appropriate for us, in the role as funder for the project, to take a different role rather than being on the project board.” – **Evidence that Transport Scotland gave to the Public Audit Committee, 2 March 2011**