

---

**From:** Carmichael S (Steven)  
**Sent:** 03 February 2012 17:31  
**To:** McLaughlin AC (Ainslie)  
**Cc:** Docherty C (Campbell); Murphy D (Dominic); Ramsay J (John); Press Transport Scotland; Chalmers D (Danny); Hornsey R (Ross); Hannaway K (Kenneth); Adamson L (Lucy); Porteous G (Graham)  
**Subject:** RE: Bidding for tram project

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

Ainslie - would suggest a verbal response in the first instance as per below, underlining that we took no part in discussions;

- Transport Scotland would not provide comment on speculative allegations and were not involved in any of the Tramco negotiations.

My feeling is we would be drawing ourselves by providing a line unless pressed to do so. If you're happy, I'll brief as per above and return to the copylist with an update.

Steven Carmichael  
Communications Team  
Transport Scotland



Buchanan House, 58 Port Dundas Rd, Glasgow, G4 0HF

---

**From:** McLaughlin AC (Ainslie)  
**Sent:** 03 February 2012 16:45  
**To:** Adamson L (Lucy); Carmichael S (Steven); Porteous G (Graham)  
**Cc:** Docherty C (Campbell); Murphy D (Dominic); Ramsay J (John); Press Transport Scotland; Chalmers D (Danny); Hornsey R (Ross); Hannaway K (Kenneth)  
**Subject:** Re: Bidding for tram project

Lucy/Steven

I would've have thought Damien would need to take care here. These are serious allegations he's making and I would very much doubt he has evidence to back any of it up.

In all probability it's an area that any Public Inquiry would probe but it is not for TS to comment or speculate on what the remit of a future Inquiry, as yet unconfirmed, will be.

Is he asking us for a line or just fishing?

If we do issue a line it will have to be very circumspect and I'd want Kenny's advice so we don't prejudice any future investigation.

My inclination is to say to him we do not comment on speculative allegations

Ainslie

---

**From:** Adamson L (Lucy)  
**Sent:** Friday, February 03, 2012 03:38 PM  
**To:** Carmichael S (Steven); McLaughlin AC (Ainslie); Porteous G (Graham)  
**Cc:** Docherty C (Campbell); Murphy D (Dominic); Ramsay J (John); Press Transport Scotland; Chalmers D (Danny); Hornsey R (Ross)  
**Subject:** Re: Bidding for tram project

Steven

Just taken a call from Mike at CEC (press) on this. Damiens not asking them for a comment specifically but clearly they're now investigating what they might say. Our responses need to jointly coordinated on this. Mike's on call this weekend so will be on his mobile.

In terms of TS position it may be a matter for CEC but there will be follow up questions as this goes back to 2007.  
Lucy

---

**From:** Carmichael S (Steven)  
**To:** McLaughlin AC (Ainslie); Porteous G (Graham)  
**Cc:** Adamson L (Lucy); Docherty C (Campbell); Murphy D (Dominic); Ramsay J (John); Press Transport Scotland; Chalmers D (Danny)  
**Sent:** Fri Feb 03 15:22:14 2012  
**Subject:** FW: Bidding for tram project

Ainslie/Graham -

Damien taking a flyer here I think on seeking comment from us couched in 'you'd probably want to position TS on this ahead of any public enquiry - in fact a number of individuals and groups are already doing so'.

Any suggestions? A matter for CEC?

Steven Carmichael  
Communications Team  
Transport Scotland

Buchanan House, 58 Port Dundas Rd, Glasgow, G4 0HF

---

**From:** Damien Henderson [<mailto:damien.henderson@heraldandtimes.co.uk>]  
**Sent:** 03 February 2012 15:03  
**To:** Carmichael S (Steven)  
**Subject:** Bidding for tram project

Steven,

As discussed....

I have heard allegations that, prior to award of preferred bidder status for the Edinburgh Tram Project, Tie artificially drove down the value of the main construction contract:

- i) By making an "off the record" approach (which I am told may be illegal) to the Bombardier/Grant Rail/Laing O'Rourke consortium to persuade them to lower their price. They declined.
- ii) By "bullying" the Siemens/Bilfinger consortium to lower costs by removing elements from the project, with the tacit understanding that these would then be added back in once the contract was signed and the design finalised.

I would welcome any response from Transport Scotland before Sunday, when I am intending to write the story up.

Best wishes,  
Damien

This email was received from the INTERNET and scanned by the Government Secure Intranet anti-virus service supplied by Cable&Wireless Worldwide in partnership with MessageLabs. (CCTM Certificate Number 2009/09/0052.) In case of problems, please call your organisation's IT Helpdesk. Communications via the GSi may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for legal purposes.

\*\*\*\*\*

This email has been received from an external party and  
has been swept for the presence of computer viruses.

\*\*\*\*\*