

---

**From:** Alan Coyle <Alan.Coyle@edinburgh.gov.uk>  
**Sent:** 25 June 2012 14:16  
**To:** Alan Coyle  
**Subject:** FW: tie severance costs CONFIDENTIAL  
**Attachments:** 04 020911 (2).doc

---

**From:** Alastair Maclean  
**Sent:** 25 June 2012 14:15:54  
**To:** Lesley Hinds  
**Cc:** Sue Bruce (Chief Executive)  
**Subject:** FW: tie severance costs CONFIDENTIAL  
**Auto forwarded by a Rule**

Lesley

Happy to talk you through the answers to your questions but in summary:

1. [Staff outwith the tie VR policy](#)

The individuals who had a negotiated package outwith the policy were Richard Jeffrey and Alastair Richards.

1.1 Vic Emery, the chairman of the tie board, negotiated an agreed severance package with Richard Jeffrey . I am not sure who was party to these discussions within CEC. He was paid his contractual notice plus an ex gratia sum.

1.2 Alastair Richards was an employee of Edinburgh Trams Limited (with tie Ltd as part of the TEL group). Following detailed internal and external legal advice, Alastair Richards was offered a termination package that comprised a voluntary redundancy package on the same terms as the tie employees together with an additional payment of £25k. Negotiations were initially by the Director of City Development and the chair of tie. I was brought in to give legal advice to minimise our exposure and conclude matters.

2. [The Council decision](#)

As you may recall, the final decision on the preferred option and funding for the tram project was taken on 2 September, when the decision of 25 August was reversed. A copy of the minutes is attached. There was a division on 2 September and on a roll call, the voting was as follows:-

**Voting**

In terms of Standing Order 31(1), the vote was taken by calling the roll.

**First Vote**

In a first vote between the motion and the amendments, the voting was as follows:

For the motion:

Lord Provost Grubb; Councillors Aldridge, Coleman, Dawe, Dundas, Edie, Lang, Lowrie, Gordon Mackenzie, MacLaren, McKay, Peacock, Snowden, Thomas and Wheeler – 15 votes

For amendment 1: (Hinds/Burns)

Councillors Ewan Aitken, Barry, Blacklock, Burns, Child, Cook, Day, Godzik, Hart, Henderson, Hinds, Milligan, Munro, Perry and Wilson – 15 votes

For amendment 2: (Cardownie/Elliott-Cannon)

Councillors Bridgman, Brock, Buchanan, Cairns, Cardownie, Elliott-Cannon, Keir, McIvor, Morris, Munn, Rankin, Tymkewycz and Work – 13 votes

For amendment 3:(Balfour/Jackson)

Councillors Elaine Aitken, Balfour, Jackson, McInnes, Mowat, Paisley, Rose, Rust and Whyte – 9 votes

For amendment 4: (Burgess/Johnstone)

Councillors Burgess, Chapman and Johnstone – 3 votes

### **Second Vote**

As there was no overall majority, amendment 4 which had received the fewest votes fell and, in a second vote, the voting between the motion and amendments 1, 2 and 3 was as follows:

For the motion:

Lord Provost Grubb; Councillors Aldridge, Coleman, Dawe, Dundas, Edie, Lang, Lowrie, Gordon Mackenzie, MacLaren, McKay, Peacock, Snowden, Thomas and Wheeler – 15 votes

For amendment 1:

Councillors Ewan Aitken, Barry, Blacklock, Burns, Child, Cook, Day, Godzik, Hart, Henderson, Hinds, Milligan, Munro, Perry and Wilson – 15 votes

For amendment 2:

Councillors Bridgman, Brock, Buchanan, Cairns, Cardownie, Elliott-Cannon, Keir, McIvor, Morris, Munn, Rankin, Tymkewycz and Work – 13 votes

For amendment 3:

Councillors Elaine Aitken, Balfour, Jackson, McInnes, Mowat, Paisley, Rose, Rust and Whyte – 9 votes

Not voting – Councillors Burgess, Chapman and Johnstone – 3

### **Third Vote**

As there was no overall majority, amendment 3 which had received the fewest votes fell and, in a third vote, the voting between the motion and amendments 1 and 2 was as follows:

For the motion:

Lord Provost Grubb, Councillors Aldridge, Coleman, Dawe, Dundas, Edie, Lang, Lowrie, Gordon Mackenzie, MacLaren, McKay, Peacock, Snowden, Thomas and Wheeler – 15 votes

For amendment 1:

Councillors Ewan Aitken, Barry, Blacklock, Burns, Child, Cook, Day, Godzik, Hart, Henderson, Hinds, Milligan, Munro, Perry and Wilson – 15 votes

For amendment 2:

Councillors Bridgman, Brock, Buchanan, Cairns, Cardownie, Elliott-Cannon, Keir, Mclvor, Morris, Munn, Rankin, Tymkewycz and Work – 13 votes

Not voting – Councillors Elaine Aitken, Balfour, Burgess, Chapman, Jackson, Johnstone, McInnes, Mowat, Paisley, Rose, Rust and Whyte – 12

**From:** "Lesley Hinds" <[Lesley.Hinds@edinburgh.gov.uk](mailto:Lesley.Hinds@edinburgh.gov.uk)>  
**Date:** 22 June 2012 13:48:41 GMT+01:00  
**To:** "Alastair Maclean" <[Alastair.Maclean@edinburgh.gov.uk](mailto:Alastair.Maclean@edinburgh.gov.uk)>  
**Subject:** RE: tie severance costs

Thanks this is very helpful. what was the decision of the Council in august and was there a division? Were there any staff who had a negotiated package out with this policy agreed by TIE? If yes, who agreed?  
Lesley

---

**From:** Alastair Maclean  
**Sent:** 22 June 2012 13:37  
**To:** Andrew Burns; Steve Cardownie; Lesley Hinds; Iain Whyte; Joanna Mowat  
**Cc:** Sue Bruce (Chief Executive)  
**Subject:** tie severance costs

I am aware that various questions are being asked about the sign off process for the above.

I have been asked in my capacity as monitoring officer to respond and attach a briefing note setting out the factual position.

I am presently considering whether or not circulating this to all members would be helpful.

Any comments gratefully received.

A

\*\*\*\*\*

This email and files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended for the sole use of the individual or organisation to whom they are addressed.

If you have received this eMail in error please notify the sender immediately and delete it without using, copying, storing, forwarding or disclosing its contents to any other person.

The Council has endeavoured to scan this eMail message and attachments for computer viruses and will not

be liable for any losses incurred by the recipient.

\*\*\*\*\*