

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

- Question** (5) If yes, what was the outcome of that meeting?
- Answer** (5) It was confirmed that decisions made were not a reflection on the quality of performance by either company. It was clarified that the Council would not give core revenue funding to these companies in this financial year. If project funding became available, officers would, however, contact the representatives to discuss further options.
- Question** (6) Are there any proposals to fund Scottish Opera in any way this financial year?
- Answer** (6) As noted in answer 5 above, officers are working to identify whether any project funding might be available.
- Supplementary Question** *Not recorded.*
- Supplementary Answer** When we consider Councillor Hinds' motion later on the agenda, Councillor Brock will be moving an amendment and I think you will find that the answers to the motion are actually in the answers to the questions that you lodged. Those talks are under way, there are discussions continuing on between Scottish Ballet, Scottish Opera and the Scottish Government and ourselves and we are indeed looking for project funding. So in fact I think your motion falls on the back of the answers to the questions because it is already happening.

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

QUESTION NO 7

**By Councillor Godzik answered by
the Convener of the Culture and
Leisure Committee**

Question

What discussions have you had with Edinburgh Leisure on the provision of crèche facilities?

Answer

The provision of crèche facilities within Leisure Centres is an operational matter for Edinburgh Leisure and its Board of Directors.

I have had separate discussions with Edinburgh Leisure on this matter both in my role as Convener for Culture and Leisure and in my capacity as a Director of Edinburgh Leisure. Councillors Cairns, Godzik, Thomas and Whyte, as fellow Directors, have also been party to Board discussions on the provision of crèche facilities.

I am pleased with the revisions made to the original proposals by Edinburgh Leisure. I understand that a further report on the provision of crèches will be provided to the Edinburgh Leisure Board at its meeting in May.

**Supplementary
Question**

Will the Convener join me in recognising the contribution of the many local campaigners that together worked constructively with Edinburgh Leisure in finding a workable solution and allowing crèche facilities to survive across the city?

**Supplementary
Answer**

Yes. I would certainly congratulate any campaigners that did produce anything like that but of course a proposal that would lead to the retention of further Edinburgh Leisure crèches was produced by SNP colleagues of mine. The proposal was put to management and then taken to the Board. It was considered by management and then the Board and I am very happy it was agreed to leaving four crèches in total to serve the four parts of the city - east, west, north and south.

QUESTION NO 8**By Councillor Godzik answered by
the Convener of the Culture and
Leisure Committee**

Question (1) Does the Council remain committed to making Edinburgh the most physically active city in Europe by 2020?

Answer (1) Yes. The key goal of the Sports and Physical Recreation Strategy is to make Edinburgh the most physically active city in Europe by 2020.

Question (2) If so, what progress has been made in this regard?

Answer (2) The following activities are all aimed at increasing the proportion of physically active people of all ages throughout the city.

Activcity

Activcity aims to promote and raise the profile of sport and physical activity events throughout the city.

The 2008 programme was launched on 23 April and involves more input from local clubs and other sport sector organisations than in previous years.

ClubSportEdinburgh

This organisation was established recently to represent the voice of amateur sports clubs in the city, and is open to all Edinburgh-based sports clubs and organisations. As well as promoting the work of the various sports clubs in the city, **ClubSportEdinburgh** aims to promote interest and participation in sport and physical recreation.

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

Edinburgh Physical Activity and Health Alliance

The Alliance was created in response to the Scottish Executive's National Physical Activity Strategy and will contribute to the next edition of the Edinburgh Joint Health Improvement Plan.

Following consultation with a range of stakeholders over June to September 2007, the Alliance has drawn up a set of five outcomes which it aims to achieve by 2011. The outcomes are aimed at increasing the proportion of physically active people of all ages.

Corporate Responsibility

In recognising the Council's responsibility and determination to be a first class employer, the Healthy Working Lives team is exploring ways to encourage sedentary employees to become more active. Activities have included Health Fairs held in Waverley Court and Chesser House and the introduction of a lunch time walking group.

Supplementary Question

Will the Convener agree with me that PE in schools could make a significant impact to making Edinburgh the most active city in Europe? Can the Convener confirm if and when two hours of PE in Edinburgh schools will be available for each and every pupil?

Supplementary Answer

I thought this might come up. I am happy to respond with an extract from a letter sent from the Minister for Education, Fiona Hyslop, in reply to the article in Scotland on Sunday. It states "We expect schools to continue to work towards the provision of at least two hours of good quality PE for each child each week". I also draw your attention to the recent doubling of funding to £12m for boosting physical activities in workplaces, schools, homes and voluntary groups.

QUESTION NO 9

**By Councillor Godzik answered by
the Convener of the Education,
Children and Families Committee**

Question

What discussions have taken place with the National Association of Youth Orchestras with regards to both the siting of their HQ and their contribution to the Festival Fringe?

Answer

Contact has been made with the Chair of the Board of the National Association of Youth Orchestras (NAYO) regarding the possible relocation of their office to London. NAYO have, however, made it absolutely clear that they intend to continue with the British Festival of Youth Orchestras in Edinburgh (and Glasgow).

The Convener of Culture and Leisure and I have arranged a meeting with senior representatives of NAYO to further discuss these matters.

**Supplementary
Question**

Why since I put a motion before this Council some three months ago has the Convener not yet met with the association to discuss this matter and does the Convener recognise realise that this is a matter of some concern to Tollcross?

**Supplementary
Answer**

Five separate dates have been given to NAYO and they have not been able to meet them and they withdrew from one of the meetings. So it is certainly not the fault of the officials of the department. We are very keen to meet with them. A date has now been agreed and I am sure that will be both productive and constructive.

QUESTION NO 10

**By Councillor Godzik answered by
the Convener of the Culture and
Leisure Committee**

Question

What discussions have taken place with the cycling fraternity with regards to providing a training facility within the City?

Answer

In line with Council's decision (13 March 2008) to continue to work in partnership with Scottish Cycling to identify an affordable and practicable solution for providing a cycling facility in Edinburgh, several meetings have been held with Scottish Cycling over the past months. These have focused on the provision of a suitable training facility for cycling. Wider discussions have also taken place with **sportscotland** and Genesis Consulting (who recently produced Scottish Cycling's Facilities Strategy).

Further work is planned with stakeholders to help determine exactly the type of facility which would best serve the cycling community in the east of Scotland.

QUESTION NO 11**By Councillor Munro answered by
the Convener of the Culture and
Leisure Committee**

- Question** (1) When will the Newhaven Heritage Museum re-open?
- Answer** (1) At the Culture and Leisure Committee of 29 April 2008 the Director of Corporate Services agreed to working towards a challenging deadline of Good Friday 2009 (10 April).
- Question** (2) What work has been undertaken by Council officers since 25th October 2007 to hasten the re-opening?
- Answer** (2) As described in the Committee report referred to above, Culture and Sport officials have held meetings with Forth Ports PLC to secure a lease for the museum premises and a team has been planning the redesign and redisplay.
- Question** (3) Is the capital sum of £60,000 secured for upgrading displays & new facilities, mentioned in answer to Council questions on 25th October 2007, still secure for this purpose?
- Answer** (3) Yes.
- Supplementary Question** Does the Convener welcome the “Good Friday Agreement” from the Culture and Leisure Committee on Tuesday and will she take officials to task to keep to this date? Will she also keep Leith Councillors involved and up-to-date on progress on this particular issue?
- Supplementary Answer** Absolutely. I am sure all concerned will do their utmost to work towards that goal and, of course, I would suggest to Councillor Munro that perhaps picking up a phone to an official just to check on progress would be appropriate as well but I will certainly be making sure that everyone proceeds towards that goal.

QUESTION NO 12**By Councillor Burns answered by
the Convener of the Education,
Children and Families Committee**

Question (1) Please provide a detailed timeline for the following four milestones:

1. design stage
2. build stage
3. construction stage
4. completion date

- for the five "Wave 3" schools below:

1. Portobello High School
2. St. John's Primary School
3. Boroughmuir High School
4. James Gillespie's High
5. St. Crispin's Special School

Answer (1) It would be premature to provide a timeline as a funding package has yet to be finalised.

Question (2) Concerning the five "Wave 3" schools, do you agree with any of the statements below?

- the Council's current position is absurd
- the required cash has been given in terms of the concordat
- the Scottish Government has no need to see any plans or proposals
- the Council can simply get on with it
- the Council is simply making excuses for inaction

Answer (2) No.

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

**Supplementary
Question**

I wonder if the Convener would like to reflect on her answer given that the statements in section 2 of my question are not statements from myself but statements from Scottish Ministers and given that I have a copy of a letter from Fiona Hyslop as Cabinet Secretary for Education and Lifelong Learning which states "I can assure you that the government has included within the local government settlement all the capital resources which were available for allocation. Nothing was held back to be allocated by government in some other way at some stage during the next three years". Is it not thus clear that as far as the Scottish Government is concerned the funding package is finalised and we as a local authority should be spending time actively looking at alternative funding mechanisms for these five schools?

**Supplementary
Answer**

No, I do not need to reflect. You have the answers in front of you. Yes, negotiations and discussions are ongoing with the Director of Finance, with senior civil servants and with the Cabinet Secretary on the way forward.

QUESTION NO 13

**By Councillor Burns answered by
the Convener of the Education,
Children and Families Committee**

Question

Can you please provide an update on the current (or as recent as possible) position of the Children and Families Department revenue expenditure, as compared to budget?

Answer

The most recent report to Council Management Team on 20th March 2008 shows a forecast adverse variance of £3.6m against budget for Children and Families Department for 2007-08.

In accordance with the final accounts timetable work is currently on-going to finalise the 2007-08 accounts and the final outturn will be reported to Council on 26th June 2008.

QUESTION NO 14**By Councillor Hinds answered by
the Convener of the Education,
Children and Families Committee**

- Question** (1) At the special Education, Children and Families Committee held on 15th April, the Organisational Review of Children and Families report contained the statement in relation to Working Together units "None of the units or bases currently supported by this funding will close". Do you believe this will be the case?
- Answer** (1) The report referred to reductions in additional Working Together support in a number of schools including Broughton High School. Each school has been aware of the potential reductions since May 2007 and generally they are being managed within the resources of the schools.
- Question** (2) Broughton Working Together unit based at Broughton High School has been informed that the unit will close. How does this square with the information contained in the report to the Education, Children and Families Committee?
- Answer** (2) Although the post has been discontinued, and there will be some reduction, the service will continue.
- Question** (3) This unit works with the most vulnerable children and would you agree the work carried out in this unit is essential in raising the educational attainment of pupils at Broughton High School?
- Answer** (3) This service does contribute to raising attainment.
- Question** (4) What assurance can the Convener give to ensure that this unit will remain open and be funded adequately?
- Answer** (4) As indicated above, the service will continue and will be funded within the available budget.

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

**Supplementary
Question**

I was contacted by Broughton School Council as they were concerned about this unit and the work that it carries out, that it would close down and the service as previously carried out would be discontinued. As they said in the e-mail to me, the school is facing a 1.5% cut in its budget but will still have to support the vulnerable children that it did such a good job working with.

With particular reference to answer (2) which says although the post has been discontinued and there will be some reduction the service will continue, could she tell me:

- How the service will continue?
- Who will provide the service?
- Where will the budget come from?

**Supplementary
Answer**

There does seem to have been confusion over the word service and the word unit which has been used by the Head Teacher of Broughton inappropriately. What has happened, as you probably know, is that it has always been an historical accident that seven schools had working together posts with no money and no budget attached to them. These posts have been taken away and all the other schools are assimilating the work and using their own resources to fund it. Broughton is the only school which seems to be having difficulties with this. Discussions are ongoing at the moment with the Head Teacher on how vulnerable children and children with behavioural problems can be supported in that school. We will continue to work with the Head Teacher to look at how we remedy this situation within the school's existing resources but I am afraid that it will have to manage in the same way that all the other schools in this city have to manage. The working together budget was half a million pounds overspent which your Administration allowed to happen. It was one of those uncontrolled areas and we could not continue with that level of overspending.

QUESTION NO 15

**By Councillor Godzik answered by
the Convener of the Health, Social
Care and Housing Committee**

Question

What action is being taken to combat graffiti, vandalism and anti-social behaviour in Leven Street and across the Tollcross area?

Answer

The Police Neighbourhood Action Unit and the local Community Safety Team are working closely to reduce anti-social behaviour through targeted problem solving. Evidence based analysis, which identifies the location and severity of any youth anti-social behaviour and criminal activity, is being utilised to direct resources effectively.

By tackling graffiti across the South sector, and through partnership working and assistance from community reporting, the most prolific offenders are being targeted.

In many areas, including Tollcross and Leven Street, covert spotter patrols and high visibility patrols, as well as the Mobile CCTV unit are being used as part of an ongoing initiative to target underage drinking. To date this operation has resulted in 670 litres of alcohol being confiscated.

In relation to vandalism, there is a recognised problem in the Tollcross area regarding flyposting. Agencies are working closely with the UNITE group who represent 31 of the nightclubs across the city. Agreement has been reached that these clubs will prohibit any of the promoters using their venues from flyposting, imposing bans from these venues for those promoters found to be in breach of this.

**Supplementary
Question**

Will the Convener outline the plans to extend the CCTV network?

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

**Supplementary
Answer**

There will be a report, I believe, to the next Health and Social Care Committee on 20 May looking into that. I haven't seen it as yet but there is an annual report about CCTV that comes up to the Council and I believe that will be in May.

Note: Councillor Godzik was later advised that the date for a report to the Health, Social Care and Housing Committee was 12 August 2008.

QUESTION NO 16**By Councillor Hinds answered by
the Convener of the Health, Social
Care and Housing Committee**

- Question** (1) How many clients who receive Home Based Services have had their service reviewed in 2007/8?
- Answer** (1) This information is not collected. Reviews are, however, carried out for all clients within 4 weeks of receipt of domiciliary care services. A regular programme of reviews is carried out by Home Care Co-ordinators, Social Workers, Occupational Therapists and others. Reviews are also targeted after 6 months and yearly thereafter.
- It is only possible to provide information on reviews carried out by the dedicated review team established in October 2007 to conduct a targeted series of reviews of clients receiving substantial levels of non-personal care. The Review Team reviewed 377 packages of care between October 2007 and 31 March 2008.
- Question** (2) How many clients have been informed that their service will be reduced or stopped?
- Answer** (2) The Review Team determined that 75 packages of care be increased and that 101 packages should continue without change. The Review Team concluded that 141 packages should receive some reduction and that 60 clients had been supported to the point where they no longer required a package of care. This now means that Home Care resources are now delivered to those with highest needs. Overall, the Council spent an extra £3.2million on Home Care Services in 2007/08. The Administration also prioritised Home Care Investment in its Budget for 2008/09 and identified an extra £2.9million.
- Question** (3) How many of these clients were assessed as being critical need?
- Answer** (3) Precise information is unavailable. The 60 packages that were ceased were assessed to be non-essential.

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

- Question** (4) How many of these clients were assessed as being substantial need?
- Answer** (4) Precise information is unavailable.
- Question** (5) How many clients have had their services increased?
- Answer** (5) 75 packages of care were increased.
- Question** (6) How many clients who were assessed as having substantial needs have been contacted since the change in the criteria following the budget process?
- Answer** (6) It has not been possible in responding to these questions to provide full answers within the given timescale. The information is contained within different recording systems and across different branches of the Department. It would take some time, absorb dedicated resources and attract disproportionate cost to gather together this information.
- We are actively responding to Social Work Inspectorate Reviews by reviewing and expanding our systems, procedures and resources for conducting reviews. Proposals were contained in the recent report on Home Care Modernisation. This will ensure that detailed information is available in future.
- Question** (7) How many clients who were assessed as substantial needs and had their service cut or reduced have had that service reinstated?
- Answer** (7) I refer to the previous answer.
- Supplementary Question** I am sure the Convener, like me, will be concerned that the clients who were assessed as needy and needing substantial care and therefore needing a service from this Council between October 2007 and April 2008 should be given the same opportunity to having a service as those clients who were assessed in this financial year. Can he give me assurance that if these clients were assessed and needing substantial care they will receive the same service as current and future clients?

**Supplementary
Answer**

I think if you look at answer (6) it is difficult to actually identify who those people are at this moment in time. Many of them though would have been re-assessed in the near future and it is open to them all to come forward and get assessed again. If they are assessed by the multi-disciplinary teams as requiring a service then they will get one.

QUESTION NO 17

**By Councillor Hinds answered by
the Convener of the Health, Social
Care and Housing Committee**

Question (1) Carers groups in Edinburgh believe that respite is their number one requirement for carers and families. Would you agree that this is also a priority for the Council?

Answer (1) Yes. A key priority of the Administration's Budget is the transformation and improvement of care for the elderly and vulnerable. This is built on the Liberal Democrats' manifesto commitment to offer more of the respite, day care and intermediate care that is in demand. The Day time respite rate per 1,000 population is double the Scottish average and significantly above the 4 main cities average.

Respite care and short breaks from caring were identified as local priorities through the consultation on Towards 2012, Carers Action Plan for Edinburgh 2007-2012. These are also detailed as priorities with Health & Social Care's Departmental Service Plan. Respite and breaks from caring also feature within the Older People's strategy - *Live Well in Later Life*; Lothian Joint Physical and Complex Disability - *Our Lives, Our Way*; Pan Lothian Learning Disability Strategy Review, and Edinburgh Joint Mental Health and Wellbeing Strategy.

Question (2) The Edinburgh strategic action plan for carer support 2008/2011 is the most current and strategic document for Edinburgh. Do you believe that the chapters on respite care and young carers are the most important to be implemented?

Answer (2) The Edinburgh Strategic Action Plan for Carers (2007-2012) is the lead joint strategic document for carers in Edinburgh. The chapters on respite care and young carers contain some of the most important priorities and action.

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

- Question** (3) When will the Director report on the implementation plan of this document?
- Answer** (3) The Health, Social Care and Housing Committee on 10th March 2008 requested a further report on the implementation plan. This is a significant and important piece of work and it is anticipated that the requested report will be brought forward in October 2008.
- Question** (4) The Scottish Government were allocated £34million for respite care from Westminster, what money has been allocated to Edinburgh?
- Answer** (4) The Westminster Government indicated that an additional £340m is being made available across the UK for services for disabled children, with the main focus to be respite and short breaks. Scotland's notional share is £34m. However this sum was not ring-fenced and is therefore not separately identifiable in the broad allocation of funds to Scotland from Westminster.
- Question** (5) If none, has there been any discussion with the Scottish Government regarding our allocation for respite care?
- Answer** (5) There is no identifiable additional allocation for respite services in the City of Edinburgh Council's broad funding for 2008 / 09 and no discussion with the Scottish Government regarding this allocation.
- Question** (6) If this allocation has been included in our overall allocation can this be identified in the Council's budget?
- Answer** (6) As stated in the answer to question (4) this is not identifiable.
- Question** (7) In the papers sent out during the budget setting exercise how much money did the Director of Health and Social Care allocate for respite care in the under budget pressure heading?

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

- Answer** (7) The unprecedented budget pressures that the Administration inherited are well documented. The Director made a speculative growth bid for additional funding of £361,000 for 2008/09 for respite care for Older People and £72,000 for other Adults (mainly learning disabilities).
- Question** (8) How much did the Administration agree to put in their budget from that heading?
- Answer** (8) The Administration's Budget for 2008/9 is about providing excellent public services that people want, efficiently and cost-effectively. The Administration successfully managed to freeze Council tax and to place the Council's finances on a stable footing. The budget for respite care remained constant. However, the Director has been asked to consider how spend on respite services can be increased within existing resources through the Older Peoples Capacity Plan and by shifting the balance of care. The outcome of this will be reported to the Health, Social Care and Housing Committee in September.
- Question** (9) Should Edinburgh not lead developments of a central one-shop Respite Bureau where people with disabilities, carers and practitioners can get whatever information and support they require to identify and plan respite? (Along the concept of a travel agency where people go to book holidays.)
- Answer** (9) The development of a central one-stop Respite Bureau is one of the strategic objectives identified in the *Towards 2012, the Carers Action Plan for Edinburgh 2007-2012*.
- Question** (10) Should CEC and NHS Lothian not appoint a joint respite lead officer to co-ordinate the development of a systematic respite improvement programme?
- Answer** (10) Yes. A proposal for a Short Breaks Implementation Officer was outlined in the city's previous respite strategy, *Breaking New Ground*, but the previous Administration never identified the resource to implement this. The proposal has been restated in the current carers action plan, *Towards 2012*.

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

Question (11) Since the Health, Social Care and Housing Committee of 4 March, who has been appointed to lead the development of respite outcomes and indicators as was agreed at that meeting?

Answer (11) Respite care development is a priority within each client area, in line with the relevant strategic plan, and is led by the key officers for these client groups. Key outcomes and indicators are identified as appropriate for each group. Performance across respite services is monitored regularly by the Joint Senior Management Team in Health & Social Care. In addition, an officer in Planning and Commissioning has the planning and co-ordination lead for respite services.

Supplementary Question I am sure the Convener and I both support an increase in respite care and are very much aware of trying to implement the Strategic Plan. I know from speaking to many of the carer groups the importance that they place on respite care and the future funding and implementation of the Strategic Plan and I am sure that both of us want to continue to work together to make sure that respite care can be provided in the future.

Would the Convener consider it appropriate to have – you said there is not an individual identified within the department – an individual who could lead the implementation of the Strategic Plan because I believe that this would send out a clear message to the carer groups of its priority to this Council? Secondly, will the Convener be pressing for extra resources to be included in next year's budget for respite care?

**Supplementary
Answer**

Can I draw your attention to the last sentence in answer (11) on page 4 of the answers which says "In addition an officer in Planning and Commissioning has the planning and co-ordination lead for respite services". So we actually have identified an individual to look after this. I am constantly pressing for extra resources from Social Work and I am constantly making sure that we spend any extra resources better than we have done in the past. This year we have had an unprecedented rise in expenditure in Social Work, I think in excess of £6m. I am not prepared to speculate as to exactly what next year's budget is going to contain at this stage but we have just got over this year's budget round; next year's budget round is another day.

QUESTION NO 18

**By Councillor Child answered by
the Convener of the Transport,
Infrastructure and Environment
Committee**

Question (1) On what days and how often are large scale packaging recycling bins emptied in Edinburgh - on street and in supermarket car parks?

Answer (1) On-street sites are usually serviced two to three times per week, depending on the demand at each location.

Other sites such as supermarkets and leisure centres are scheduled according to need, with some being serviced seven times per week.

Where there is higher demand, we review the frequency, days of collection and the number of recycling banks.

Question (2) What is the current level of complaints about bins overflowing at weekends and people frustrated in their attempts to recycle their packaging?

Answer (2) In March there were 66 complaints recorded on the Waste Services complaints system.

Although the level of complaint is low in the context of the number of sites, where the Department is made aware of recurrent problems at specific sites and in specific areas appropriate action is taken to address this.

The Recycling Service has grown organically and we have responded to the need to review the routes, collection frequencies and the number of vehicles covering the service. Additional vehicles have been added to the service at the weekends to cover the busiest times. This work is ongoing and those areas of high demand identified at the current time are being addressed first. We have also introduced improved street sweeping and jet cleaning around containers in the city.

QUESTION NO 19**By Councillor Hinds answered by
the Convener of the Transport,
Infrastructure and Environment
Committee**

- Question** (1) When was the proposal for pavement construction and renewal in Arboretum Avenue put in the capital programme?
- Answer** (1) Arboretum Avenue was included in the 2007/08 Capital Footway Works Programme as reported to the Council Executive on 27 March 2007.
- Question** (2) When was it agreed to put this programme of work in the 07/08 capital programme?
- Answer** (2) See Answer 1 above.
- Question** (3) When were plans put together to carry out these works?
- Answer** (3) A pre-design assessment was undertaken in July 2007. This highlighted that the surface of the west pavement was not suitable for pedestrians as it was uneven. During the detailed design phase, which began in early February 2008, the east pavement was viewed as also being in need of repair.
- Question** (4) What notification was given to communities and local Councillors regarding when this work would happen?
- Answer** (4) As no residential properties front directly onto the pavement works on Arboretum Avenue, no residents were required to be notified. The Local Ward Members for the Inverleith area should have been advised in advance of the works. They were not and for this I apologise.
- Question** (5) How long were the works anticipated to take?

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

- Answer** (5) The pavement works on Arboretum Avenue were programmed to last for seven weeks.
- Question** (6) How long has the work being going on? When will it be finished?
- Answer** (6) Work commenced on 6 March and is programmed for completion on or before 28 April 2008 ie a total period of 7¹/₂ weeks.
- Question** (7) What supervision was in place for this project?
- Answer** (7) The pavement work on Arboretum Avenue was undertaken by Road Services' operatives, under the daily supervision of a Roads Supervisor and a Works Agent.
- Question** (8) How many trees were damaged and subsequently removed from Arboretum Avenue?
- Answer** (8) The widening of the unsuitable, uneven west pavement required the removal of the existing kerbs, which sat adjacent to the existing trees and were entangled within the tree roots. During the excavation works associated with the removal of the kerbs, the roots of seven trees, already in poor to fair condition, were damaged and the bark on three of these tree trunks was scarred. Owing to this damage and the fact that six other undamaged trees were previously assessed as being in a poor to fair condition, and would have needed replacing in the future, the opportunity was taken to replace thirteen of the existing trees with new stock, in conjunction with the pavement renewal works.
- Question** (9) What inspection was carried out on these trees before the work started?
- Answer** (9) When the trees were inspected by arboricultural specialists on 10 March, prior to being damaged during the removal of the existing kerbs, all thirteen of the trees that were removed were graded as being in a fair or poor condition. The inspection report highlights previous root and trunk damage, and makes reference to the fact that the branches of most trees infringed onto the road.

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

- Question** (10) How much are the anticipated costs?
- Answer** (10) The final pavement improvement work is anticipated to cost £120,000.
- Question** (11) Do you agree that this project has been mishandled?
- Answer** (11) As indicated, in line with agreed procedures, local Members should have been notified in advance of work commencing.
- It is clear that these trees would have been replaced in any case, and with additional trees planted to fill the gaps, this work has further enhanced the street.
- Question** (12) What lessons can be learned from this project?
- Answer** (12) An evaluation is currently being conducted. I shall ensure that the findings and recommendations of this evaluation inform and improve current working practices.
- Supplementary Question** Will this report be available to Inverleith Neighbourhood Partnership because concerns were raised at its business meeting? Secondly, the costs have increased substantially since the information I was given only a few weeks ago. Can I be given an assurance that no projects in the Inverleith Neighbourhood Partnership will be affected by this overspend?
- Supplementary Answer by Councillor Aldridge** I am happy to make sure that the evaluation of the project is made available to the local Councillors and I apologise for the local Councillors not being informed. As for the second issue, it fell within the overall budget which had been set. I will have to check but as far as I am aware no particular projects in your area will be affected.

QUESTION NO 20

**By Councillor Godzik answered by
the Convener of the Transport,
Infrastructure and Environment
Committee**

Question

What action is being considered to improve and develop public transport in the south of the city?

Answer

This Administration is committed to ensuring that Edinburgh is a free-moving city with excellent, integrated public transport. Specific actions to improve and develop public transport are set out in the Local Transport Strategy. Key actions which strongly promote public transport in the south of the city include:

South East Edinburgh Bus Priority Feasibility Study

The Council has commissioned consultants to develop proposals to further enhance bus routes in this area. This study will be the subject of a future report to Transport, Infrastructure and Environment Committee.

Edinburgh Orbital Bus Routes Feasibility Study

SEStran is investigating the feasibility of new orbital routes in the south of the city that would serve major locations such as Edinburgh Park, Queen Margaret University, the Royal Infirmary and Park & Ride sites. A report is due later this year.

Park & Rides

Sheriffhall Park & Ride with 561 spaces has recently opened with additional bus services provided running through south Edinburgh. Straiton Park & Ride with some 600 spaces is due to open this autumn. This will see further bus enhancements from Lothian Buses. Lothianburn has also been identified as a potential Park & Ride site, and Midlothian Council is progressing this.

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

In addition, public transport in south Edinburgh will also benefit from various city-wide initiatives that are being progressed including: the expansion of *Bustracker*; Selective Vehicle Detection at traffic signals; Bus lane camera enforcement; and, City wide harmonisation of bus lane hours.

**Supplementary
Question**

Does the Convener agree that reopening the South Suburban Line would greatly complement the services outlined in the answer and does he further agree that 1.4m (car) journeys removed from the roads in the south of the city would greatly benefit in reducing congestion in those areas?

**Supplementary
Answer**

Yes.

QUESTION NO 21

**By Councillor Johnstone answered
by the Convener of the Transport,
Infrastructure and Environment
Committee**

Question (1) To ask the Convener of Transport what provision is being made for cycle parking in Princes Street?

Question (2) To ask the Convener of Transport if the Council is addressing the issue of insufficient and inconvenient cycle parking in tenements?

Answer This Administration is committed to promoting cycling and to making Edinburgh a cycle-friendly city.

Answer (1) Cycle parking is currently provided on Princes Street at the Royal Scottish Academy at the Mound, the Princes Mall and adjacent to Register House.

Over 100 new cycle racks have been installed in the city centre, many close to Princes Street - in particular along Rose Street (where 36 spaces have been provided) and on Castle Street.

Answer (2) A pilot scheme looking at the provision of cycle storage in tenement areas has been undertaken in partnership with SPOKES. Three locations were selected for investigation on the basis that they were likely to present opportunities for identifying solutions to a variety of cycle parking requirements.

A report on the feasibility of introducing a scheme in Edinburgh is to be presented at the Transport, Infrastructure and Environment Committee on 6 May 2008.

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

**Supplementary
Question**

It would have been a little bit more helpful if the response had contained some information on the three locations selected for investigation with the pilot. I welcome the Liberal Democrat manifesto commitment to make Edinburgh a model, cycle friendly city and I would like to ask if the Convener is aware that Britain's biggest free indoor city centre cycle park opened in Cambridge last month in the city centre? It is covered, it provides benefits both to cyclists and to local businesses and, if you haven't had a chance to look at it, is it something you would like to see in Edinburgh in the future?

**Supplementary
Answer**

I am sure the officers can produce the locations for the pilot; I don't have them to hand. I am grateful for the information about the Cambridge initiative. I will look at that with interest.

QUESTION NO 22

**By Councillor Burgess answered by
the Leader of the Council**

Question

Will the Council Administration sign up to the 'World Mayors and Local Governments Climate Protection Agreement' launched at the United Nations Climate Change Conference in Bali, Indonesia, December 2007?

Answer

We are committed to achieving a zero carbon economy for the city by 2050. The Council has already signed up to the Scottish Climate Change Declaration which requires local authorities to address many of the same issues as in the World Mayors' Agreement including reducing emissions, reporting on progress and adapting to impacts.

Whilst it does no harm to sign up to agreements on a global scale, these are more beneficial where the objectives and actions extend beyond our existing strategies. The commitments in this Climate Protection Agreement largely rehearse targets contained in our Climate Change Framework and the Scottish Climate Change Declaration, with the exception of the specific call for global temperatures to be held below a 2 degree Centigrade increase and for advocacy of local government representation in UN climate change discussions.

**Supplementary
Question**

I asked whether the Administration would sign up to the World Mayors and Local Governments Climate Protection Agreement. The negative answer from the Council Leader is disappointing. It leads me to wonder why the Administration doesn't want to sign up to this agreement, hopefully not because the Administration isn't fully committed to reducing Edinburgh's emissions

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

Would the Leader agree with me that this is actually a great opportunity for Edinburgh to demonstrate its commitment at a global level alongside other great cities such as New York and London. I appreciate the Administration may not have had much time to fully consider this proposal and I ask the Leader if her Administration will not rule out the signing up to this agreement.

**Supplementary
Answer**

I'm sorry that you found the answer negative; it was not intended to be. I'll explain why I didn't say yes and then perhaps we can have some dialogue about this later.

I believe that we have already moved on from the agreement that was signed in Bali and I have to say I do question the carbon footprint even with the climate legacy initiative in place to carbon offset. The papers for the follow up conference in Zaragoza in Spain in June actually acknowledge that signing up to similar or complementary regional initiatives, of which of course the Scottish Climate Change Declaration is one, is seen as just as useful a way to help mobilise a global campaign of highly committed local governments. I am not sure that the case has actually been made for signing up to this particular agreement at the conference in Bali. Mayor Bloomberg was its main proponent and I am not sure the case has been made that we would actually gain anything from signing up to it. I don't think it is signing us up to anything that we have not already signed up to and just signing a piece of paper isn't what we are about. We actually want action taken.

However, If perhaps after this meeting or in the next day or two, you can make a case as to why you think it is particularly important that this piece of paper be signed up to, as opposed to taking action, then I would be very happy to consider it.

QUESTION NO 23

**By Councillor Burgess answered by
the Convener of the Transport,
Infrastructure and Environment
Committee**

Question (1) How much climate-changing pollution (tonnes CO₂) was emitted by flights 1) leaving from, and 2) arriving at, Edinburgh airport in each of the last ten years?

Answer (1) Carbon dioxide emissions are not included in the Council's review and assessment of local air quality. BAA, however, promotes the responsible use of energy and each of its airports have been set targets to reduce carbon dioxide emissions.

Question (2) What estimate has been made of the amount of additional climate-changing pollution (tonnes CO₂) from increased air traffic as a result of the proposed expansion of Edinburgh airport as outlined in the Rural West Edinburgh Local Plan?

Answer (2) As acknowledged in the Masterplan for Edinburgh Airport, detailed work in assessing the effect on carbon dioxide emission of an expansion of Edinburgh Airport will be undertaken once a planning application is received. BAA have reduced their carbon dioxide emissions at Edinburgh Airport by 100% above their target. A 4% overall reduction has been achieved.

Supplementary Question I asked how much carbon dioxide is emitted by flights to and from Edinburgh Airport because I think it is important we know the extent of these emissions and therefore their impact on this Council's policies regarding air travel and the airport.

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

Concerningly, the Administration has been unable to provide any figures either for emissions now or any estimates for the future regarding the proposed expansion of the airport. Is the Convener prepared to provide these figures for climate change emissions in and out of Edinburgh Airport so that the Council can formulate its policy in full knowledge of its consequences?

**Supplementary
Answer by
Councillor
Aldridge**

The answer to question (1) states that the air quality monitoring that the Council is obliged to carry out and carries out does not look at carbon dioxide; it measures nitrogen dioxide for example. It also states in the answer to question (2) that if and when a planning application comes forward in relation to expansion of the airport, that application will have to contain an assessment of the carbon dioxide output. At present we do not have that information and I think perhaps if you directed your questions to the British Airports Authority, you might get more information from them.

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

Appendix 2
(As referred to in Act of Council No 6 of 1 May 2008)

Appointments for 2008/09

Membership of Committees

Policy and Strategy Committee - 17 members – 5 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 4 Scottish National Party, 4 Labour, 3 Conservative, 1 Green

Leader of the SLD Group	Convener of the Finance and Resources Committee
Leader of the SNP Group	Convener of the Health, Social Care and Housing Committee
Leader of the Labour Group	Convener of the Transport, Infrastructure and Environment Committee
Leader of the Conservative Group	Councillor Blacklock
Leader of the Green Group	Councillor Hinds
Convener of the Culture and Leisure Committee	Councillor Jackson
Convener of the Economic Development Committee	Councillor McInnes
Convener of the Education, Children and Families Committee	Councillor Munn
	Councillor Murray

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEES

Culture and Leisure Committee – 13 members – 4 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 3 Scottish National Party, 3 Labour, 2 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor Lang	Councillor Hart
Councillor Morris	Councillor Henderson
Councillor Snowden	Councillor Elaine Aitken
Councillor Thomas	Councillor Buchan
Councillor Bridgman	Councillor Johnstone
Councillor Brock	Leader (ex officio)
Councillor Cairns	Deputy Leader (ex officio)
Councillor Godzik	

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

Economic Development Committee – 13 members – 4 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 3 Scottish National Party, 3 Labour, 2 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor Lowrie	Councillor Maginnis
Councillor McKay	Councillor Milligan
Councillor Snowden	Councillor Rose
Councillor Coleman	Councillor Rust
Councillor Brock	Councillor Chapman
Councillor Buchanan	Leader (ex officio)
Councillor Elliott-Cannon	Deputy Leader (ex officio)
Councillor Hart	

Education, Children and Families Committee – 17 members – 5 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 4 Scottish National Party, 4 Labour, 3 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor Dundas	Councillor Burns
Councillor Edie	Councillor Maginnis
Councillor Lang	Councillor Milligan
Councillor Gordon Mackenzie	Councillor Balfour
Councillor MacLaren	Councillor Buchan
Councillor Beckett	Councillor Whyte
Councillor Bridgman	Councillor Johnstone
Councillor Keir	Leader (ex officio)
Councillor Munn	Deputy Leader (ex officio)
Councillor Blacklock	

Added Members for Education Matters

A Craig Duncan (Religious Representative)
Cathy Clark (Religious Representative)
Robert Gould (Religious Representative)
Margaret Bryce-Stafford (Teacher Representative)
Raymond George Simpson (Teacher Representative)

Finance and Resources Committee – 13 members – 4 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 3 Scottish National Party, 3 Labour, 2 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor Aldridge	Councillor Murray
Councillor Gordon Mackenzie	Councillor Wilson
Councillor McKay	Councillor Kate MacKenzie
Councillor Wheeler	Councillor Rose
Councillor Buchanan	Councillor Chapman
Councillor Elliott-Cannon	Leader (ex officio)
Councillor Munn	Deputy Leader (ex officio)
Councillor Child	

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

Health, Social Care and Housing Committee – 17 members – 5 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 4 Scottish National Party, 4 Labour, 3 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor Edie	Councillor Burns
Councillor Hawkins	Councillor Hinds
Councillor Morris	Councillor Munro
Councillor Peacock	Councillor Elaine Aitken
Councillor Coleman	Councillor Kate MacKenzie
Councillor Beckett	Councillor Paisley
Councillor McIvor	Councillor Chapman
Councillor Tymkewycz	Leader (ex officio)
Councillor Work	Deputy Leader (ex officio)
Councillor Barry	

Transport, Infrastructure and Environment Committee – 17 members – 5 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 4 Scottish National Party, 4 Labour, 3 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor Aldridge	Councillor Child
Councillor Dundas	Councillor Henderson
Councillor Hawkins	Councillor Munro
Councillor Peacock	Councillor Jackson
Councillor Wheeler	Councillor McInnes
Councillor Buchanan	Councillor Mowat
Councillor Cairns	Councillor Burgess
Councillor Keir	Leader (ex officio)
Councillor McIvor	Deputy Leader (ex officio)
Councillor Barry	

OTHER COMMITTEES

Audit Committee – 13 members – 4 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 3 Scottish National Party, 3 Labour, 2 Conservative. 1 Green

Councillor Dundas	Councillor Ewan Aitken
Lord Provost Grubb	Councillor Murray
Councillor Morris	Councillor Wilson
Councillor Coleman	Councillor Balfour
Councillor Munn	Councillor Jackson
Councillor Tymkewycz	Councillor Burgess
Councillor Work	

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

Planning Committee/Development Management Sub-Committee

15 members – 5 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 3 Scottish National Party, 3 Labour, 3 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor Lowrie
Councillor Dundas
Councillor Morris
Councillor Peacock
Councillor Thomas
Councillor Keir
Councillor McIvor
Councillor Munn

Councillor Hinds
Councillor Child
Councillor Milligan
Councillor Mowat
Councillor Rose
Councillor Paisley
Councillor Burgess

Regulatory Committee and Licensing Sub-Committee – 9 members – 3 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 2 Scottish National Party, 2 Labour, 2 Conservative

Councillor Lang
Councillor McKay
Councillor Coleman
Councillor Keir
Councillor Cairns

Councillor Henderson
Councillor Perry
Councillor Kate MacKenzie
Councillor Mowat

Vacation Committee – 11 members – 3 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 2 Scottish National Party, 3 Labour, 2 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor Dawe
Councillor Aldridge
Councillor Edie
Councillor Buchanan
Councillor Brock
Councillor Ewan Aitken

Councillor Hart
Councillor Perry
Councillor Whyte
Councillor Jackson
Councillor Johnstone

Administration of Trust Funds

Pensions and Trusts Committee – 5 members – 1 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 1 Scottish National Party, 1 Labour, 1 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor McKay
Councillor Beckett
Councillor Murray

Councillor Rose
Councillor Chapman

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

Committee on the Royal High Endowment – 5 members – 1 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 1 Scottish National Party, 1 Labour, 1 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor Lang
Councillor Work
Councillor Hinds

Councillor Kate MacKenzie
Councillor Johnstone

Committee on the Jean F Watson Bequest – 8 members plus one nominee of Friends of the City Arts Centre and three nominees of Director of Culture and Leisure – 2 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 2 Scottish National Party, 2 Labour, 2 Conservative

Councillor Dawe
Councillor Thomas
Councillor Brock
Councillor McIvor

Councillor Godzik
Councillor Wilson
Councillor Elaine Aitken
Councillor Buchan

Appeals etc

Committee on Discretionary Rating Relief Appeals – 5 members – 1 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 1 Scottish National Party, 1 Labour, 1 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor Gordon Mackenzie
Councillor Munn
Councillor Perry

Councillor Paisley
Councillor Chapman

Personnel Appeals Committee – 9 members – 2 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 2 Scottish National Party, 2 Labour, 2 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor Coleman
Councillor Lowrie (Convener)
Councillor Cairns
Councillor Elliott-Cannon
Councillor Blacklock

Councillor Hart
Councillor Elaine Aitken
Councillor Paisley
Councillor Burgess

Committee on Pupil and Student Support – 5 members and one religious representative – 1 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 1 Scottish National Party, 1 Labour, 1 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor MacLaren
Councillor Beckett
Councillor Burns

Councillor Balfour
Councillor Johnstone
Robert Gould (religious representative)

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

Placing in Schools Appeals Committee – 3 persons drawn from three Panels as described in Standing Order 41

Panel 1 – All members of Council and religious and teacher representatives on the Education, Children and Families Committee

Social Work Complaints Review Committee – 3 persons drawn from a panel approved by the Council (does not include Councillors)

Recruitment

Recruitment Committee

Leader of Council (Convener), Deputy Leader of the Council, Convener of the Finance and Resources Committee and the appropriate Executive Committee Convener and relevant opposition spokespersons (or nominees)

Head Teacher Appointments Committee – Core Group – 13 members and 3 religious representatives – 4 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 3 Scottish National Party, 3 Labour, 2 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor MacLaren
Councillor Hawkins
Councillor Lang
Councillor Morris
Councillor Beckett
Councillor Tymkewycz
Councillor McIvor

Councillor Burns
Councillor Child
Councillor Hart
Councillor Balfour
Councillor Kate MacKenzie
Councillor Johnstone

Advisory Committees

Advisory Committee on Youth Services – 5 members – 1 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 1 Scottish National Party, 1 Labour, 1 Conservative, 1 Green

Councillor MacLaren
Councillor Beckett
Councillor Burns

Councillor Rust
Councillor Chapman

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

Joint Boards and the Licensing Board

Lothian and Borders Fire and Rescue Board – 9 members – 3 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 2 Scottish National Party, 2 Labour, 2 Conservative

Councillor Dawe	Councillor Hinds
Councillor Lang	Councillor Barry
Councillor Hawkins	Councillor Buchan
Councillor Bridgman	Councillor Rust
Councillor McIvor	

Lothian and Borders Police Board – 9 members– 3 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 2 Scottish National Party, 2 Labour, 2 Conservative

Councillor Dawe	Councillor Murray
Councillor MacLaren	Councillor Milligan
Councillor Dundas	Councillor Whyte
Councillor Cardownie	Councillor Mowat
Councillor Munn	

Lothian Valuation Joint Board/Lothian Electoral Joint Committee – 9 members – 3 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 2 Scottish National Party, 2 Labour, 2 Conservative)

Councillor Edie	Councillor Perry
Councillor Gordon Mackenzie	Councillor Burns
Councillor Wheeler	Councillor Buchan
Councillor McIvor	Councillor Rust
Councillor Beckett	

Forth Estuary Transport Authority – 4 members – 2 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 1 Scottish National Party, 1 Conservative

Lord Provost Grubb	Councillor Work
Councillor Wheeler	Councillor McInnes

Licensing Board – 9 members – 3 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 2 Scottish National Party, 2 Labour, 2 Conservative

Councillor Thomas	Councillor Barry
Councillor McKay	Councillor Blacklock
Councillor Coleman	Councillor Balfour
Councillor Work	Councillor Paisley
Councillor Cairns	

The City of Edinburgh Council
1 May 2008

Scotland Excel (Procurement) – Joint Committee – 2 members – 1
Administration, 1 Opposition

Councillor Elliott-Cannon
Councillor Munro

South East Scotland Regional Transport Partnership – 5 members/5
depute members – 2 Scottish Liberal Democrat, 1 Scottish National Party, 1
Labour, 1 Conservative

Substantive Members

Councillor Snowden (SLD)
Councillor Wheeler (SLD)
Councillor Buchanan (SNP)
Councillor Henderson (L)
Councillor McInnes (C)

Depute Members

Councillor Dundas (SLD)
Councillor Hawkins (SLD)
Councillor Munn (SNP)
Councillor Child (L)
Councillor Jackson (C)

Lothian and Borders Community Justice Authority – 1 member – Scottish
Liberal Democrat

Councillor Edie