
From: Hudson Steve [Steve.Hudson@carillionplc.com]
Sent: 25 November 2008 22:48
To: Steven Bell
Subject: RE: Decision Time

Steven,

It may be unfortunate but time is now of the essence and we need to reach resolution on Thursday as the situation is now untenable. Consequently, I needed to spell out the situation as we see it so you are in no doubt about the challenge we face. We would not have achieved this over the phone.

I am available tomorrow before 9 and I'm happy to discuss how we proceed.

Regards

Steve Hudson
Commercial Director
Carillion Utility Services

Office telephone: 0161 855 6000
Facsimile: 0161 855 6186
Mobile: [REDACTED]
Please note new e-mail address: steve.hudson@carillionplc.com

P SAVE PAPER - Please do not print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This e-mail message and accompanying data are for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain information that is confidential. If you are not the intended recipient, you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you have received this mail in error please notify us immediately and erase all copies of this message and its attachments. Thank you.

-----Original Message-----

From: Steven Bell [mailto:Steven.Bell@tie.ltd.uk]
Sent: Tuesday, November 25, 2008 10:35 PM
To: Hudson Steve
Subject: RE: Decision Time

Dear Steve

It is unfortunate that you have chosen to communicate these issues at this time and in this manner.

Regrettably I have commitments tomorrow morning which mean that I am unable to devote time to responding to your lengthy allegations and assertions as promptly as I would like.

However, I shall telephone you before 9 (If you are unavailable, I shall leave another message) and speak with you prior to any more formal response.

I remain available to address the agreement issues, measurement issues and the quality of work items previously raised as proposed on Thursday at 10.

I would be obliged if you would ensure that you never raise such serious allegations with me by email without having tried to telephone me to discuss the matters in advance.

Yours sincerely,

Steven Bell
Edinburgh Tram Project Director

tie Ltd
Citypoint
65 Haymarket Terrace
Edinburgh
EH12 5BD

T: 0131 622 8396
F: 0131 622 8301
M: [REDACTED]
e mail: steven.bell@tie.ltd.uk

Sent from my mobile handset

-----Original Message-----

From: Hudson Steve <Steve.Hudson@carillionplc.com>
Sent: 25 November 2008 21:44
To: Steven Bell <Steven.Bell@tie.ltd.uk>
Subject: Decision Time

Steven,

In advance of our meeting on Thursday, I thought it appropriate to spell out the dynamics we now collectively face, which will require resolution on Thursday in order that we can positively progress the Project.

Namely, we continue to experience significant delays to programme as a consequence of;

- Delays in design issue
- TM and Stakeholder restrictions
- Growth and change in work scope
- Delay in TQ resolution
- Inadequate tie leadership and project management

This has led to the significant cost increases and the establishment of adversarial relationships and the lack of resolution of the October 'agreement' is symptomatic of the above issues.

Background;

The fundamental failings of the contract go right back to the lack of design delivery during PCS services. This frustrated the development of the programme, prevented true value engineering and resulted in the majority of PCS objectives not being met.

Against the backdrop of the failure of PCS we agreed a settlement in 2007, incorporating the rev 06 programme and the resolution of disputes up to Sept 07. In good faith we both felt that 'going forward' the design detail and definition would improve and we could progress the contract efficiently and cost effectively. We also held meetings to discuss

the 'blockers' to progress and to improve collaboration between our teams and the teams made a joint commitment on the 12th December 2007 to work in this manner. Subsequently the tie Limited project management team fundamentally failed to deliver any of their commitments; indeed their actions and behaviours throughout 2008 have been in direct contravention of these commitments.

The reality therefore was that the designs did not flow as intended, the quality of the designs and subsequent TQ process were inadequate and this has resulted in significant further delays and cost increases. Equally the teams became entrenched in their respective positions and relationships deteriorated.

Back in February of this year we actually wrote highlighting the issues and withdrawing all Works Order Proposals as the efficacy of the Contract had been undermined. (copy attached). Furthermore, in March we provided a substantial submission addressing the issues surrounding the veracity of the rates and prices, as a consequence of the foregoing issues. These letters, as many issued during the currency of the contract, have yet to be responded to.

By the summer we therefore found ourselves in significant delay, without clarity of work scope or programme and with significant claims for additional payment. This clearly presented significant challenges to the overall Tram project with the imminent commencement of Infraco. Indeed, we were further away from the 'collaboration' approach agreed on the 12th December 2007 than at any other period of the contract.

Hence we commenced discussions regarding another 'agreement', incorporating a revised programme and commercial settlement. These were, we believed, eventually concluded in October when Roger Robinson met Willie Gallagher.

For clarity I set out the following principles of that collective discussion and agreement;

- 1) Adoption of Rev 7.09 programme, incorporating extension of Longstop Date.
- 2) Settlement of commercial disputes up to the end of Sept '08 with payment up to £1.2m now and £800k against future milestones.
- 3) Payment of all prelims, both historic and future.
- 4) Indexation to apply as the contract from the 1st July.
- 5) Reimbursement of the shortfall between resource value earned through the rates and the cost incurred in targeting the programme.

I believe that unless we reaffirm our respective commitment to the principles outlined above, the project will suffer further and we will have no option other than to progress in a cost effective manner with appropriate protection of both cost and time being afforded to us under the contract. The choice is yours.

During the past 4 months we have strengthened our team, introduced new management controls and generally responded to your criticisms of our performance, whether justified or not. Quality and safety management have significantly improved, and although a few teething troubles remain we are dealing with these on a daily basis. Remedial works for historical problems are progressing - I know these are frustrating for both our teams, but we are taking our responsibilities seriously and will complete them as soon as we possibly can. In short, we are making every effort to deliver the project to your satisfaction.

I now believe that having made changes to our personnel to improve delivery, that it is time that tie did likewise and removed the 'blockers' from their team. In this respect, I request the removal of John Casserly and his commercial team with immediate effect.

John and his team have a history of;

- failing to meet deadlines set
- failure to certify in accordance with the contract timescales
- failure to pay in accordance with contract timescales
- failing to administer the contract and action correspondence
- a source of mis-information and misleading statements

Equally, John's negative and adversarial 'attitude' was exposed in the partnering workshop we organised to enhance Collaboration and clearly his behaviours are inconsistent with our joint objectives.

I believe that John and his team should be replaced with an 'independent' team who can administer the commercial framework of the contract, without reference to or consideration of client budget and personal agendas. This would give us both confidence that the works were being administered in a timely manner, properly evaluated and budgeted thereby reducing areas for contention.

I make no apologies for the length of this e-mail as I believe its absolutely essential that we conclude the way forward when we meet on Thursday.

We can discuss in advance if you wish to call me.

<<Works Order withdrawl letterDOC241108.pdf>>

Regards

Steve Hudson
Commercial Director
Carillion Utility Services

Office telephone: 0161 855 6000
Facsimile: 0161 855 6186
Mobile: [REDACTED]
Please note new e-mail address: steve.hudson@carillionplc.com

P SAVE PAPER - Please do not print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This e-mail message and accompanying data are for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain information that is confidential. If you are not the intended recipient, you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you have received this mail in error please notify us immediately and erase all copies of this message and its attachments. Thank you.

CARILLION VALUES

Openness - Collaboration - Mutual Dependency - Professional Delivery -Sustainable Profitable Growth - Innovation

This e-mail transmission, including any attachments, is confidential to the intended recipient. It may contain privileged and confidential information. If you have received this e-mail in error, please delete it and notify the postmaster@carillionplc.com. You must not disclose its contents to anyone, retain, copy, distribute or take action in reliance upon it.

Carillion may monitor outgoing and incoming e-mails. By replying to this e-mail you give your consent to such monitoring.

Carillion plc: Registered in England No. 3782379 Registered Office: Birch Street
Wolverhampton WV1 4HY.

This message has been scanned for viruses by BlackSpider MailControl
<http://www.blackspider.com/>, however, Carillion does not accept any responsibility for
viruses and it is your responsibility to scan or otherwise check this e-mail and any
attachments.

The information transmitted is intended only for the person to whom it is addressed and
may contain confidential and/or privileged material. If you are not the intended
recipient of this e-mail please notify the sender immediately at the email address above,
and then delete it.

E-mails sent to and by our staff are monitored for operational and lawful business
purposes including assessing compliance with our company rules and system performance.
TIE reserves the right to monitor emails sent to or from addresses under its control.

No liability is accepted for any harm that may be caused to your systems or data by this
e-mail. It is the recipient's responsibility to scan this e-mail and any attachments for
computer viruses.

Senders and recipients of e-mail should be aware that under Scottish Freedom of
Information legislation and the Data Protection legislation these contents may have to be
disclosed to third parties in response to a request.

tie Limited registered in Scotland No. SC230949. Registered office - City Chambers, High
Street, Edinburgh, EH1 1YT.

Click
<https://www.mailcontrol.com/sr/U!BHwXmGl2!TndxI!oX7UvLs8dGn3uon4az7KX2wHbZoZs2HTv+onNuGy6JcHkLZhqWMsafvb3s00zGclh82!Q==> to report this email as spam.