

Item	Opportunity	Filter	Proposal Origin	Opportunity Champion	Work Stream affected	Current Status	Collated Summary			Anticipated Degree of Success				Contract Change Notice Ref	Comments (from 29.8.7)
							Scoop	Roley	Category	Scoop		Roley			
										%age	£	%age	£		
SUMMARY (Columns 1 & 2)			SCOOP	ROLEY											
Infraco															
	Banked & Confirmed - Cat 1 (In base bids)		£8,513,442	£5,331,442											
	Banked - Cat 2 (confirmed by stakeholders/TEL)		£4,228,132	£4,073,779											
	Furtherwork - Cat 3		£5,869,056	£4,984,268											
	Post Preferred Bidder - Cat 4 (Oct - Dec 2007)		£9,950,000	£10,550,000											
	Sub Total		£28,560,630	£24,939,489											
Non Infraco															
	Banked - Cat 5		£2,755,600	£2,755,600											
	Furtherwork - Cat 6		£7,530,500	£7,530,500											
	Sub Total		£10,286,100	£10,286,100											
	Overall Total		£38,846,730	£35,225,589											
OVERALL TOTALS							£38,846,730	£35,225,589		£8,513,442	£5,331,442				
BUILDINGS _ Andy Steel															
3	Power supply - Rationalise layout of modular housings to reduce overall space requirements	Buildings	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£43,000		3	0		0			
134	Substations - Some (all?) are shown on "stilts". Is this strictly necessary?	Buildings			Infraco	OPEN	£83,556		3	0		0			Ie believe there is no benefit deleting this from the design - VE minute 3.9.7
BUILDINGS TOTAL							£126,556	£0		£0	£0				
DEPOT --- Andy Steel															
7	Track geometry at the Depot - rationalise layout Currently 32 turnouts at depot, remove 6 nr could result in £0.5m saving	Depot	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£140,000		2	0		0			
8	Delete depot pumping station/storm tanks by utilising existing gravity system which has been confirmed to be at a suitable level where diversion is not required. Who takes risk if it doesn't work?	Depot			PD	OPEN	£193,526	£193,526	3	0		0			Ie board approval. £140k achieved, £190k estimated in Sign Off Sheet
9	Depot - Build part now with provision to expand in the future/reduce size of car park facilities	Depot	Project - 9.1.3 (see also Item 10)		SDS	OPEN	£230,000	£230,000	2	0		0			Ie board approval 'At Risk' achieved, £230k estimated in sign off sheet - why is this Cat 2?
16	Depot - split vehicle accommodation system - requirement dependant on tram vehicle selection	Depot	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£27,500	£27,500	2	0		0			Sign Off Estimate £27.5k. How is this cat 2?
17	Depot - Track Maintenance Equipment - rationalise scope requirement	Depot	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£27,500	£27,500	2	0		0			Sign Off Estimate £27.5k. How is this cat 2?
20	Depot - deletion of one pavement (inner). <i>Does this allow longer sidings?</i>	Depot	Project - 7.2.2		Infraco	OPEN	£36,000	£36,000	2	0		0			
24	Depot - delete requirement for concrete apron to security fence	Depot	SDS		Infraco	OPEN	£6,080	£6,080	2	0		0			

Technical Comment (Roley)
AS
17 Sept 07

TEL comment on Scoop if considered relevant
Transdev Comment by RNHJ 17 Sept 2007

Item	Opportunity	Filter	Proposal Origin	Opportunity Champion	Work Stream affected	Current Status	Column 1 Column 2 Column 3			Column 4 Column 5 Column 6 Column 7			Contract Change Notice Ref	Comments (from 29.8.7)	
							Collated Summary			Anticipated Degree of Success					
							Scoop	Roley	Category	Scoop	Roley				
26	Depot - Lower the roof sufficiently to allow the depot to rise 1.5 metres from the current level. (not incl in item 145)	Depot	Project - 7.2.8		Infraco	OPEN	£1,200,000	£1,200,000	1	100%	1,200,000	100%	1,200,000		
129	Depot - delete compressed air system, utilise 1 or 2 local compressors	Depot	Project - 16.3.2		Infraco	OPEN	£54,400	£54,400	2		0		0		
144	Omit Piling at A8 - incl adds for soil nailing/excavation to north & discovery of 'chamber' . Change driven from footprint moved northwards as a consequence of Earl demise.	Depot					£3,850,000	£2,850,000	1	100%	3,850,000	100%	2,850,000		
145	Delete VE items 10, 11, 19 and replace with the following consolidated Depot - changes to initial Depot design driven by proximity to BAA runway (reduced bulk excavation), reductions in structural loadings (gantry crane reduced in capacity and size impacting on building frame and envelope), reductions in staff accommodation provision (reduced operational workforce reducing messing facilities, changing rooms, locker space, etc), reduction in fitout specification and a reduction in domestic utility capacity (reduced building volume and accommodation provision).	Depot				OPEN	£3,181,264	£3,181,264	2		0		0		tie board approval. A new depot plan available with elevations due Thurs 13.9.7. JP to refresh estimate on full implications of depot changes.
DEPOT TOTAL							£8,946,270	£7,806,270			£5,050,000		£4,050,000		
HIGHWAYS ---- Susan Clark															
34a	Lindsay Road - Vertical alignment optimization - minimise highway reconstruction	Highways	Scoop	SDS	Infraco	OPEN			4		0		0		Infraco & Mudfa
34b	Picardy Place - Vertical alignment optimization - minimise highway reconstruction	Highways	Scoop	SDS	Infraco	OPEN			4		0		0		Infraco & Mudfa
36a	Material recovery and reprocessing - MUDFA 2 options - reconstituted planings & Type 1R	Highways		GB	Mudfa	OPEN	£150,000	£150,000	6		0		0		SB - use Sign Off sheet estimate £150k
36b	Material recovery and reprocessing - INFRACO 2 options - reconstituted planings & Type 1R				Infraco	OPEN					0		0		
37	Reduction in extent of road reinstatement. Premis that base course/road base material used in lieu of wearing course until properly reinstated under INFRACO MUDFA temporary reinstatements	Highways	Project		MUDFA	OPEN	£145,000	£145,000	6		0		0		MUDFA Team assessment of opportunity £145,000
142	Highways - Deletion of twinned 800mm SW potable water main around Gogar Depot and replace with single 800mm. By diverting the existing route of the pipeline from within the footprint of the depot around the perimeter the security of supply is maintained.	Highways			MUDFA	OPEN	£0	£0	TBA		0		0		Was the diversion of this main always within the MUDFA Scope or is this just COST AVOIDANCE? MUDFA Team assessment £750,000 GB to confirm effect on Mudfa Risk Items
152	(New) Reduce Kerb and associated re-instatement of pavement	Highways			INFRACO	OPEN		£100,000	3		0		0		BBS - rationalise where possible, e.g. where pavements are being widened do not replace
153	(New) Reduce drainage run from guideway	Highways			INFRACO	OPEN		£100,000	3		0		0		BBS - Could be undertaken in conjunction with direct fix to guideway
HIGHWAYS TOTAL							£295,000	£495,000			£0		£0		
LAND & PROPERTY---A Sim															
136	Land & Property - specific plots of land that may no longer be required	Land & property	Project		Land & Property	OPEN	£340,000	£340,000	5		0		0		
LAND & PROPERTY TOTAL							£340,000	£340,000			£0		£0		
NETWORK RAIL---Steven Bell															

Technical Comment (Roley) AS 17 Sept 07
TEL comment on Scoop if considered relevant
Transdev Comment by RNHJ 17 Sept 2007

Is already "banked" as VE saving at this price!
VE register 129
How are Tramlines shown at same price?
Minor ER change if not already done.
ER already modified I believe. CAF have expressed preference for power operated tools. Half-way house maybe to fit pipework and then decide on fixed compressor and reservoir at a later date but provide space for them.
Need to confirm with Tramco the detailed proposals. Otherwise thought already agreed.

CEC planning issue?
Does the Street/highway demarcation agreement help?
Cannot comment without more information: happening in detailed design in any case? Design has probably not yet reached the stage of establishing exactly what is required in any case.

Presumably refers to the Fastlink takeover?
Would need further evaluation once existing drainage is understood.
Cannot comment without more information.

Item	Opportunity	Filter	Proposal Origin	Opportunity Champion	Work Stream affected	Current Status	Collated Summary			Anticipated Degree of Success			Contract Change Notice Ref	Comments (from 29.8.7)
							Scoop	Roley	Category	Scoop	Roley			
							Column 1	Column 2	Column 3	Column 4	Column 5	Column 6		
42	NR Immunisation - ETN only to pay for Direct Current Immunisation (£3.5m)	NR	Project - 7.2.4		Infraco	OPEN	£2,800,000	£2,800,000	6		0		0	Not Infraco Scope.
NETWORK RAIL TOTAL							£2,800,000	£2,800,000			£0		£0	
OLE---Andy Steel														
49	Overhead Contact system - Switchgear - rationalise specification - considered "quite onerous"	OLE	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£336,000	£336,000	2		0		0	VE sheet estimate £321.5k
135	OLE - Catenary opportunity in Sections 5 to 7 - replace trolley wire with catenary on segregated sections.	OLE-	Project		Infraco	OPEN			3		0		0	
139	Removal of Stainless Steel Cantilevers	OLE	Scoop 3		Infraco	OPEN	£37,300		3		0		0	
140	Removal of Stainless Steel Equipment Cubicles	OLE	Scoop 3		Infraco	OPEN	£8,400		3		0		0	
149	(NEW) Provision of combined incoming and return cabinet	OLE	Roley		Infraco	OPEN		£42,000	3		0		0	
OLE TOTAL							£381,700	£378,000			£0		£0	
STRUCTURES----David Crawley/Tony Glazebrook														
52	Soil stabilisation - sub grade - stabilise with lime & cement - Taken to Phase 1b	Structures	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN					0		0	
53	Soil stabilisation - retaining slopes - use of gunite, block and crib walling, soil nailing, gabions etc. in lieu of retaining walls - Taken to Phase 1b	Structures	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN					0		0	
54	Value Engineering developed for the final designs for all structures, particularly substructures and foundations	Structures	Scoop, Roley, Project - 14.2.9	SDS	Infraco	OPEN	£8,000,000	£8,000,000	4		0		0	Scoop offer per AS1 s'sheet £4m. DC Structures Report 10.9.7 - Tower Pl (£2m*80%), Victoria Dock Br (£0.5m*80%) - funding to be from non tram source (non budget items) ie this is cost avoidance rather than a budget saving. Other structures incl are: Crewe Rd, Russell Rd, Roseburn St Br, Murrayfield Retaining Wall & Training Pitches, Water of Leith Br, Brd Drive Ret Wall, Russell Rd Br, Crewe Rd Gdns Br, Coltbridge Via, Gogarburn Br, South Gyle Acc Rd Br & Roseburn Ter Br & Carrick Kn Br & all totalling £5.705m*80%. Item 57 A* underpass £2m*80% - traffic diversion arrangements key (bidder dependent) ie least cost option may = higher short term disruption. GG 17.9.7 - per GG review of remaining structures listed in DC Report
55	Edinburgh Park Bridge - utilise steel beams in lieu of concrete Edinburgh Park Viaduct	Structures	Project, Scoop, Roley		Infraco	OPEN	£1,000,000	£1,000,000	4		0		0	DC Structures Report 10.9.7 - Highly dependent on steel costs & NEL agreement. Bidder cost statements at odds with budgeted position so saving in doubt. Prudent to reduce to £250k*80%. GG 17.9.7 - £1m - Infraco bidder to advise proposals for achieving structures savings
56	Structures - Carricknowe Bridge Parapet - down grade from P6 / P5 to N2 (reduced cost of parapet plus knock on effect on deck design/cost) Opportunity reflected within Item 54 pending further design	Structures	Project - 7.2.3	SDS (TK)/JP	Infraco	OPEN					0		0	
57	Structures - A8 Underpass - over sized? Opportunity reflected within Item 54 pending further design	Structures	Project - 24.1.32	SDS	Infraco	OPEN					0		0	
58	Structures - Eastburn Ave Works - flood defence works - ensure no over scoping, betterment or over funding Opportunity reflected within Item 54 pending further design	Structures	Project - AH13		Infraco	OPEN					0		0	

Technical Comment (Roley) AS 17 Sept 07
 TEL comment on Scoop if considered relevant
 Transdev Comment by RNHJ 17 Sept 2007

Tramlines have offered similar proposal but with higher savings. Seems a modest saving to obtain an inferior result. NOT RECOMMENDED. No particular comment in principle, but agree with TEL.

Do not totally understand what this means. As it is labelled OLE assume it is something to do with the feeds to and from the OLE at sub-stations. Might be quite sensible and could be what BW are already proposing for Tramlines. Seems ok on the face of it. Cannot comment without more information.

Item	Opportunity	Filter	Proposal Origin	Opportunity Champion	Work Stream affected	Current Status	Collated Summary			Anticipated Degree of Success			Contract Change Notice Ref	Comments (from 29.8.7)	
							Scoop	Roley	Category	Scoop	Roley				
59	Structures - reduce structure thickness by 25mm Opportunity reflected within Item 54 pending further design	Structures	Project - AH115		Infraco	OPEN					0		0		
60	Structures - EARL Structure S33 - remove from estimate	Structures	Project - 14.2.6		Infraco	OPEN	£913,442	£913,442	1	100%	913,442	100%	913,442		Not relevant. Bidders to clarify
131	Structures - minimise alteration work to Holiday Inn Access Bridge to bare minimum proposed in HMR1 Design Substantiation Report "Roseburn Corridor: Holiday Inn Access Bridge" Doc Number ULE90130-03-REP-00206 i.e. provide compressible board and joint seal	Structures				OPEN			3		0		0		
132	Structures - delete requirement for compensatory floodwater storage at Gogarburn in line with proposal contained in report "Compensatory Floodwater Storage Assessment" Doc Number ULE90130-07-REP-00029 V1	Structures				OPEN			3		0		0		
146	Structures - Haymarket Viaduct - redesign to reduce cost of deck	Structures	Project	DC		OPEN	£250,000	£250,000	4		0		0		DC Structures Report 10.9.7 - estimated £0.25m*80% . The design can be produced to satisfy CEC Planning. GG 17.9.7 - Infraco bidder to advise proposals for achieving structures savings
147	Structures - Lindsay Road Retaining Wall - simplify design or delete entirely through discussion with CEC, FP	Structures	Project	DC		OPEN					0		0		DC Structures Report 10.9.7 - estimated £2m*80% assuming agreement with Forth Ports GG 17.9.7 - additional costs to be funded by Forth Ports
154	(New) Class 7 material conversion -	Structures	Project		INFRACO	OPEN		£300,000	3		0		0		Class 7 material converted to RE fill for S21B and S21D, W8 (W of Leith to New Balgreen Road Br Wingwall Material suitable for conversion in the Depot excavation will need to be identified and "set aside" as soon as possible.
155	(New) W11 structure	Structures	Project		INFRACO	OPEN		£50,000	3		0		0		Bankhead drive retaining wall to be constructed in conjunction with direct fix of reall to structures, fine tuning of track alignment will reduce or remove the need for a retaining wall.
STRUCTURES TOTAL							£10,163,442	£10,513,442			£913,442		£913,442		
SUPERVISORY & COMMS---Andy Steel/Alastair Richards															
63	Signalling & Comms - De-spec some requirements off EBIScreen eg the requirement for making Radio calls from it, selecting CCTV cameras, etc	Supervisory & Comms	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£91,000		3		0		0		Scoop confirmed £91k. Put to TPB Sign Off sheet estimate £27.5k
65	Signalling & Comms - fewer CCTV cameras	Supervisory & Comms	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£266,000	£266,000	1	100%	266,000	100%	266,000		sign off sheet estimate £87.5k Scoop/Roley confirmed £266k BBS have included a number of cameras which meet the requirements of the ITN, further savings would need to be developed with tie.
66	Signalling & Comms - Delete Mimic Display Panel in the CTC	Supervisory & Comms	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£78,000	£65,000	1	100%	78,000	100%	65,000		Scoop/Roley confirmed £78k/£65k
68	Signalling & Comms - Dual feed the Tramstop Equipment Panels from adjacent substations instead of having a separate UPS in each cabinet	Supervisory & Comms	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£166,000	£20,000	1	100%	166,000	100%	20,000		sign off sheet estimate £87.5k Scoop/Roley confirmed £166k/£20k
69	Signalling & Comms - rationalise fibre optic rings - are 3 really necessary? More economic architecture that performs the same function could be employed	Supervisory & Comms	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN			3		0		0		
70	Signalling & Comms - Provide separate pieces of Control Equipment on each Operators desk instead of integrating them on a touch screen console	Supervisory & Comms	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£70,000		3		0		0		
71	Signalling & Comms - fewer Operator positions (Also fewer operators - OPEX)	Supervisory & Comms	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£20,000	£10,000	1	100%	20,000	100%	10,000		Roley £10k - Opex Issue (GG)

Technical Comment (Roley) AS 17 Sept 07
TEL comment on Scoop if considered relevant
Transdev Comment by RNHJ 17 Sept 2007

Please refer to the latest update on the VE structures for current proposal for these structures.
Also ensure that VE structures team are aware of these latest proposals as they may be different from that proposed earlier by BBS.
Is this already included in bids? No problem in principle.

Please refer to the latest update on the VE structures for current proposal for this structure.
Also ensure that VE structures team are aware of this latest proposal as it may be different from that proposed earlier by BBS.
Cannot comment without more information.

Tramlines have offered similar proposal and near identical price.
Suggest this is because both bidders have responded to the AS/RJ revised CCTV headcount of c90 cameras.
The ER may have been tidied up already to reflect this (can TK comment)
Agreed
Agreed

Tramlines have offered similar proposal and near identical price.
See TEL comment. Note no mimic was acceptable to Transdev.
Simple change to ER
Agreed, but require an overhead projection of workstation screen on the wall. Suggest this will reduce saving by £8k
Agreed with proposal to remove entirely

Tramlines have offered similar proposal. However BBS proposal offers substantially greater savings.
It may be that two bidders now have different approach to the need for any UPS in addition to the dual feed.
That would need overall of UPS requirements in ER's
Agree with TEL comment that RAMS risk has to stay with bidder.
Agreed, but RAMS and performance requirements must still be achieved at bidders risk.
Agreed in principle; needs some detailing to confirm

Tramlines have offered similar proposal but with twice the savings.
Simple change to ER
Agreed
Agreed. Actually no opex saving as the positions were only ever shown to allow for future expansion and were not expected to be provided or planned to be staffed.

Item	Opportunity	Filter	Proposal Origin	Opportunity Champion	Work Stream affected	Current Status	Collated Summary			Anticipated Degree of Success				Contract Change Notice Ref	Comments (from 29.8.7)	Technical Comment (Roley) AS 17 Sept 07	TEL comment on Scoop if considered relevant	Transdev Comment by RNHJ 17 Sept 2007		
							Scoop	Roley	Category	Scoop	Roley									
73	Signalling & Comms - Current requirement for location and interface of the SCADA and Points controllers etc is unnecessarily complex. A solution based on Nottingham Tram would provide a less complex and user friendly option	Supervisory & Comms	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£13,000		1	100%	13,000	100%	0							
74	Signalling & Comms - rationalise loop quantities by combining some loop functions	Supervisory & Comms	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£87,500	£87,500	2		0		0	Scoop/Roley confirmed £87.5k BBS feel loop qty can be optimised further, this would have to be developed with tie to ensure the System performance is not compromised	Tramlines have offered similar proposal but with less savings. Essentially this will be the final development of the SDS design. Not an ER issue. Agree with TEL comment	If no reduction in ultimate system performance then fine, but performance risk remains with Infraco.	Agreed; rationalisation would always be part of detailed design in any case			
75	Signalling & Comms - Remove ambient noise sensing on the passenger announcement system	Supervisory & Comms	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£7,000	£7,000	1	100%	7,000	100%	7,000	Scoop/Roley confirmed £7k	Tramlines have offered similar proposal and near identical price. Still require night/day changeover. Simple change to ER	Agreed	Agreed			
133	Signalling & Comms - GPS based signalling and tram positioning detection (i.e Virtual Loops)		Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£316,723	£50,000	3		0		0	Cannot happen if item 23 taken. Red denotes PR calc 1a/1b Sign Off Sheet Estimate cautious £500k BBS do not recommend a GPS based signalling system as accuracy of tram positioning will be poor, BBS estimate cost saving to be £50,000	Tramlines have offered similar proposal but with much higher savings. This would be the level that would be expected rather than that offered by BBS. However Tramlines have failed to provide the assurances on reliability and redundancy we have asked for (as have HMRI with equal response) The BBS answer reflects an earlier verbal response from them to the Technical Team. Sadly need to reject from both bidders.	Not enough information to proceed at this point.	Agree with TEL that insufficient information available.			
SUPERVISORY & COMMS TOTAL							£1,115,223	£505,500			£550,000		£368,000							
SYSTEM WIDE----Susan Clark																				
77	Optimise the work site lengths wherever practical to ensure efficient construction outputs	System Wide	Project - 5.1.1 ??		Infraco	OPEN	£300,000	£300,000	4		0		0	Probability = £1.5m to £.75m range * 20% Sign Off Sheet £300k SC email 17.9.7 £300k						
80	Accept more disruption over shorter period to maximise efficiency of construction operations -	System Wide	Project - 5.1.1	SC/AH/KR	Infraco/Tramco	OPEN	£100,000	£100,000	4		0		0	Probability = £1.0m to £.5m range * 20% Sign Off sheet £100k SC email 17.9.7 £300k						
148	(New) Remove spare capacity from OTN (linked to item 69)	System Wide			Infraco	OPEN		£180,000	3		0		0	Current system includes capacity of 1A & 1b	This appears to suggest reducing the capacity of the OTN fibre-optic cables rather than a re-configuration as was proposed by Tramlines. Would need to see revised OTN architecture to give view. Is essentially a question of the extent to which tie wish to future proof the system.	Await further info. Need to check what the cost of running 1b at a later date was versus this saving.	Cannot comment without more information.			
150	(New) Option of lease UPS provision from Supplier rather than purchase	System Wide			Infraco	OPEN		£300,000	4		0		0	The BBS supplier of UPS equipment offers the leasing/rental of UPS equipment with or without maintenance.	This might be worth looking at commercially. However how does it relate to the proposal at 3 above? Would require overall review of total UPS requirements across the system.	Await commercial details.	Cannot comment without more information.			
151	(New) Rationalising spares supplied with the Infraco bid	System Wide			Infraco	OPEN		£300,000	4		0		0	BBS would suggest that the level of initial spares supplied as part of the Infraco contract could be reviewed and reduced and other options such as SLA delivery mechanisms adopted	The Midland Metro Concessionaire made last minute "savings" by removing spares other than consumable from the supply (both infrastructure and trams). The operator ending up buying later at a premium with system availability compromised in the process. In this case the Infraco has maintenance responsibility. Therefore how spares are procured is nominally at their risk. Provided they are prepared to take this it might be acceptable. Really a commercial issue including handover at end of Mtence period. Need to ensure Mtence offer is in line.	Personally consider that the design is too insufficiently developed for anyone to take a safe-bet on spares requirements. Insufficient spares is of no use to anyone, regardless of contractual responsibility. Reputationally if the tram system is not reliable everyone suffers. Would recommend leaving this as work to be further developed during the initial phase of the contract.	Agree with TEL.			
157	(New) Omit Section from OCT to Newhaven Rd.				Infraco	OPEN			4		0		0	Range between £6-7.5m. Mid range taken meantime.						
SYSTEM WIDE TOTAL							£400,000	£1,180,000			£0		£0							
THIRD PARTY----Jim McEwan																				

Item	Opportunity	Filter	Proposal Origin	Opportunity Champion	Work Stream affected	Current Status	Column 1 Column 2 Column 3			Column 4 Column 5 Column 6 Column 7			Contract Change Notice Ref	Comments (from 29.8.7)	
							Collated Summary			Anticipated Degree of Success					
							Scoop	Roley	Category	Scoop	Roley				
90a	Murrayfield Pitch Relocation - Flood prevention scheme	Third Party	Project		Infraco	OPEN	£1,915,600	£1,915,600	5		0				
90b	Murrayfield Pitch Relocation - mods only to Waranders Club House	Third Party	Project		Infraco	OPEN	£500,000	£500,000	5		0				
THIRD PARTY TOTAL							£2,415,600	£2,415,600			£0	£0			
TRACK FORM ----- Steven Bell															
91	Track bed construction details - reduce track slab thickness with structurally efficient members	Trackform	Scoop	SDS	Infraco	OPEN	£2,000,000		1	100%	2,000,000	100%	0	E2m offered by Scoop incl in headline bid figure. Only applies to Scoop.	
92	Track form - specific application of types - adopt ballasted track wherever possible. Predominantly Phase 1b saving? Taken to Phase 1b	Trackform	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN					0		0	Already in - GG	
97	Thinner track slab impact on MUDFA (linked to 91 above)	Trackform	Project - 24.1.26		MUDFA	OPEN	£2,462,500	£2,462,500	6		0		0	MUDFA Team assessment of opportunity £500,000 - No back up received. GB says £2.5m includes Infraco (item 91)...needs resolution.	
100	Noise attenuation (outside of Roseburn Corridor) 3,650m of fencing	Trackform	Project - 31.1.9		Infraco	OPEN					0		0		
138	Trackform - changing embedded to ballast rail.	Trackform	Scoop 3		Infraco	OPEN	£3,000,000		3		0		0	E/O saving proposed by Scoop 24.8.7 not in headline bid fig. Applies to Scoop only.	
156	(New) Track installation installation in strips	Trackform	Roley		Infraco	OPEN		£2,000,000	3		0		0	Install trackform in discrete strips rather than in one complete channel	
TRACK FORM TOTAL							£7,462,500	£4,462,500			£2,000,000	£0			
TRACTION POWER----Jim McEwan															
103	11Kv Traction Power feeds to sub stations (12 nr at E302k each)	Traction Power	Project - 31.1.16	TK	Infraco	OPEN	£1,468,742	£1,468,742	3		0		0	Sign Off Sheet has £2.4m achieved & £1.47m estimate	
104	Network Reinforcement - not to be paid for by ETN	Traction Power	Project - 31.1.16	AD/BE	Infraco	OPEN	£1,973,000	£1,973,000	6		0		0	Sign Off Sheet has £2.2m achieved & £2.45m estimate	
108	Power supply - Track / Bypass Isolators - switches could be combined with the DC switchgear in the substation	Traction Power	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£101,888	£87,535	2		0		0	Scoop/ Roley confirmed E102k/£87k	
109	Power supply - Russell Rd TPH - could equipment for future upgrade to substation be supplied when this is actually realised? I.e. don't supply transformer rectifier now.	Traction Power	Scoop		Infraco	OPEN	£56,809		3		0		0		
158	(New) Power Supply (up to passenger operation) - possible over allowance in DFBC						£300,000	£300,000	4		0		0	£1.3m in DFBC (fully inflated)	

Technical Comment (Roley) AS 17 Sept 07
 TEL comment on Scoop if considered relevant
 Transdev Comment by RNHJ 17 Sept 2007

Tramlines have offered similar proposal but with much higher savings. Suspect this is because BBS relates to reduced scope on 1A while Tramlines is system wide. See TEL note. Perhaps to be re-visited on site by site basis as part of "last resource" review. Not an ER issue as such.

Consistent position has been that there is not ballast in certain locations for good reasons. TEL do not see merit in pursuing this.

Clarity needed about where proposal to be applied; otherwise agree with TEL.

Surely this is the same as their Ref 8 above? See previous comments

Consistent position has been that there is not ballast in certain locations for good reasons. TEL do not see merit in pursuing this.

Agreed that this is repetition.

This has never been formally raised by the BBS track team (Bilfinger or Siemens) Therefore it is surprising to see it appear like this especially with such a large figure associated with it. It has certainly been done elsewhere but there still has to be the certainty that track gauge and relative alignment can be maintained for the life of the system. That will require more information than presented here. Timescales for PB probably do not permit this. Suggest leave open for option for use in particular areas for PB stage.

Cannot comment without more information; feel very nervous.

Tramlines have offered similar proposal but with higher savings. Do not think needs ER change but only minor if does. Acceptable. Note TEL comment. However this is nothing to do with manual/motorised, only the bringing together of all switchgear in one place.

OK so long as no increased training or licensing obligations.

Agreed in principle; needs some detailing to confirm

Item	Opportunity	Filter	Proposal Origin	Opportunity Champion	Work Stream affected	Current Status	Collated Summary			Anticipated Degree of Success			Contract Change Notice Ref	Comments (from 29.8.7)
							Scoop	Roley	Category	Scoop	Roley			
TRACTION POWER TOTAL							OPEN	£3,900,439	£3,829,277		£0	£0		
TRAM STOPS---Alistair Richards/Geoff Gilbert														
110	Delete 2 tram stops (Ocean Drive & S Gyle) leaving provision for adding stops back in the future. This is unlikely to be acceptable politically. Plus 2 x Phase 1b stops	Tram Stops	Project - 31.1.13	tie/Tel	Infraco	OPEN			3	0		0		
112	Prefab drop-in tram stops and other items. It has been agreed that substations will be package substations	Tram Stops	Project - 24.1.30	GG	Infraco	OPEN			3	0		0		
113	Tram stops - finishes to be minimum standard throughout	Tram stops	Project - 5.1.24	SDS	Infraco	OPEN			3	0		0		
TRAM STOPS TOTAL							OPEN	£0	£0		£0	£0		
TRAMS---Alistair Richards														
116	Tram mock-up - use an existing mock-up rather than purchasing new	Trams	Project - 24.1.10	DP	Tramco	OPEN				0		0		Not in budget
117	Reduce fleet size - run 8+8 on 1a only (26 trams) or 6+6 on 1a and 1b (26 trams) build in option to buy additional trams in the future)	Trams	Project - 24.1.4	AR	Tramco	OPEN				0		0		
119	Reduce fleet size - delete 1 tram from spare capacity and accept risk to lower performance	Trams	Project - 5.1.17	AR	Tramco	OPEN	£500,000	£500,000	3	0		0		
121	Trams - place passenger counters on only 20% of fleet - not whole fleet. Counters deemed inaccurate	Trams	Project - 31.1.5	AR	Tramco	OPEN			1	100%	0	100%	0	£400k saving in Tramco Bid
127	Trams - Reduce service to 4 trams per hour on Phase 1b, saving 2 trams - then press Developer to buy 2 trams to increase service frequency Taken to Phase 1b	Trams		Project - 14.2.3	Tramco	OPEN			3	0		0		
TRAMS TOTAL							OPEN	£500,000	£500,000		£0	£0		
OVERALL TOTALS							OPEN	£38,846,730	£35,225,589		£8,513,442	£5,331,442		

Technical Comment (Roley) AS 17 Sept 07
 TEL comment on Scoop if considered relevant
 Transdev Comment by RNHJ 17 Sept 2007

Do not really understand. Presumably they are suggesting less intensive service leading to lower peak demand. However reducing transformer size to say 800KVA should give more than £20k savings. Do not understand comment on diodes as these units come packaged as transformer-12 start-rectifier sets. Anything other than that would be special at increased cost. Does not sound like value for money.

Would need to be convinced that increasing power supply in future was economic upgrade, rather than scrapping and replacing all the substation equipment. Would doubt whether this will represent VFM, or something that the bidders will stand behind.

Do not understand this proposal.

NOTE: Financial Impact calculated on average Max/Min impact multiplied by the probability of success

DEFINITIONS	
BANKED'	Items offered by bidders or developed by project team.
IN PROGRESS'	Potential for further saving (undisclosed)
CLOSED'	No Value / Dead

Item	Opportunity	Filter	Proposal Origin	Opportunity Champion	Work Stream affected	Current Status	Collated Summary			Anticipated Degree of Success		Contract Change Notice Ref	Comments (from 29.8.7)		
							Column 1	Column 2	Column 3	Column 4	Column 5			Column 6	Column 7
							Scoop	Roley	Category	Scoop	Roley				
	REJECTED'		Value exists but not attainable												
	OPEN'		Active Item under review												

Technical Comment (Roley)
AS
17 Sept 07

TEL comment on Scoop if considered relevant
Transdev Comment by RNHJ 17 Sept 2007