

---

**From:** Rebecca Andrew  
**Sent:** 29 May 2008 15:09  
**To:** Ian Stirton; Christine Rigouleau  
**Cc:** Alan Coyle  
**Subject:** FW: TIE BP

What is your view on this? We are aware that Willie Gallagher is not the only Executive Chair of a Council Company, which is contrary to the Cadbury Code (and presumably its successor codes), but the fact that he is on both the audit and remuneration committees is also bad practice. It is my understanding that these committees should only comprise non-execs.

Rebecca

Rebecca Andrew | Principal Finance Manager | Financial Services | The City of Edinburgh Council | Waverley Court, Level 2:5, 4 East Market Street, Edinburgh, EH8 8BG | Tel: [REDACTED] [rebecca.andrew@edinburgh.gov.uk](mailto:rebecca.andrew@edinburgh.gov.uk) | [www.edinburgh.gov.uk](http://www.edinburgh.gov.uk)

---

**From:** Alan Coyle  
**Sent:** 29 May 2008 14:12  
**To:** Lex Harrison; Rebecca Andrew  
**Subject:** RE: TIE BP

Lex

Without me making mischief here, have you had any feedback from SMG on the corporate governance question re the Exec Chair sitting on the audit & remuneration committee's? Would it not be appropriate to have a paragraph in the Council Report on Corporate Governance commenting on the governance arrangements - Chair/Chief Exec role and the presence of said individual on the Audit and Remuneration Committee. Rebecca, I wonder what internal audits view would be on this practice as clearly tie's audit committee do not have a problem with it?  
A

Alan Coyle | Finance Manager (Tram Project) | Financial Services | City Development Team | Level 2/5 Waverley Court | 4 East Market St EH8 8BG | [alan.coyle@edinburgh.gov.uk](mailto:alan.coyle@edinburgh.gov.uk) | [REDACTED]

---

**From:** Lex Harrison  
**Sent:** 29 May 2008 13:48  
**To:** Alan Coyle  
**Subject:** FW: TIE BP

---

**From:** Stewart McGarrity [<mailto:Stewart.McGarrity@tie.ltd.uk>]  
**Sent:** 29 May 2008 10:56  
**To:** Lex Harrison  
**Subject:** RE: TIE BP

I don't believe there are any differences Lex?

Stewart

Stewart McGarrity  
Finance Director  
tie Limited  
Mobile: [REDACTED]

---

**From:** Lex Harrison [mailto:Lex.Harrison@edinburgh.gov.uk]  
**Sent:** 28 May 2008 14:47  
**To:** Stewart McGarrity  
**Cc:** Max Thomson  
**Subject:** RE: TIE BP

Stewart  
I had sought an answer to this question from Alan Coyle but been unable to get hold of him today.  
Why are actuals reported in this years bp different from historical out-turns presented in previous bp's?  
Are these two different things?  
Lex

---

**From:** Stewart McGarrity [mailto:Stewart.McGarrity@tie.ltd.uk]  
**Sent:** 26 May 2008 11:42  
**To:** Lex Harrison; Alan Coyle; Max Thomson  
**Subject:** FW: TIE BP  
**Importance:** High

I'll be back in the office on Wednesday morning and will hopefully wrap it up then.

Stewart

---

**From:** Lex Harrison [mailto:Lex.Harrison@edinburgh.gov.uk]  
**Sent:** 23 May 2008 12:44  
**To:** Stewart McGarrity  
**Cc:** Max Thomson  
**Subject:** TIE BP  
**Importance:** High

Stewart

Here is your report with combined comments from Alan Coyle and myself.  
You will note concerns about the membership of the audit and remuneration committees.  
So far as personnel numbers are concerned the details don't need to be included in the report but I do want to understand how the numbers stack up given they are way above anything I have ever experienced.  
Information on design packages is also for my benefit.

When are you back in the office?

Lex

---

This email and files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended for the sole use of the individual or organisation to whom they are addressed.

If you have received this eMail in error please notify the sender immediately and delete it without using, copying, storing, forwarding or disclosing its contents to any other person.

The Council has endeavoured to scan this eMail message and attachments for computer viruses and will not be liable for any losses incurred by the recipient.

---

<HRsize=2 width="100%" align=center>

The information transmitted is intended only for the person to whom it is addressed and may contain confidential and/or privileged material. If you are not the intended recipient of this e-mail please notify the sender immediately at the email address above, and then delete it.

E-mails sent to and by our staff are monitored for operational and lawful business purposes including assessing compliance with our company rules and system performance. TIE reserves the right to monitor emails sent to or from addresses under its control.

No liability is accepted for any harm that may be caused to your systems or data by this e-mail. It is the recipient's responsibility to scan this e-mail and any attachments for computer viruses.

Senders and recipients of e-mail should be aware that under Scottish Freedom of Information legislation and the Data Protection legislation these contents may have to be disclosed to third parties in response to a request.

tie Limited registered in Scotland No. SC230949. Registered office - City Chambers, High Street, Edinburgh, EH1 1YT.